

Florida State University Libraries

2018

Development of Professional Identity for Counseling Professionals: A Mindfulness-Based Perspective

ShengLi Dong, Linda Miles, Neil Abell and Jadelyn Martinez

This is an accepted manuscript in the International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling, the version of record can be found at <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10447-018-9338-y> .



Development of Professional Identity for Counseling Professionals:

A Mindfulness-Based Perspective

Abstract

Professional identity development (PID), which involves transformational learning, is crucial for counselors and trainees. However most current training approaches focus more on specific tasks related to PID without focusing on the transformational learning aspect. Mindfulness is an important component for transformational learning; however, limited effort has been focused on its likely impact on PID. This conceptual article describes the need for integrating mindfulness into PID, and explains applications of mindfulness practices in assisting counselors to enhance development of a professional identity in the course of completing transformational tasks through a transformative learning process. Recommendations for future practice and research are included.

Keywords: mindfulness, professional identity development, counselors and trainees, transformational tasks, transformative learning

Professional identity development (PID) is pivotal to counselors and trainees (Corey, Corey, & Callanan, 2010; Granello & Young, 2012), and can be defined as the “successful integration of personal attributes and professional training in the context of a professional community” (Gibson, Dollarhide, & Moss, 2010, pp. 23–24). The Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) standards (2016) highlight the important role of professional identity in training professional counselors, and describe eight core areas (such as professional counseling orientation and ethical practice, social and cultural diversity, and assessment and testing) that address the fundamental knowledge and skill base for professional counseling identity development (CACREP, 2016).

Researchers have emphasized the significance and value of PID in counselor education (Gibson et al., 2010; Luke & Goodrich, 2010), and highlighted that the process of PID should start from the onset of a training program and continue over the entire course of one’s professional career (Auxier, Hughes & Kline, 2003; Brott, 2006). When a counselor trainee or a new professional does not develop a strong sense of professional identity or is not well integrated into the profession, it could contribute to role confusion (Studer, 2007), potentially jeopardizing the quality of counseling services provided (Pistole & Roberts, 2002). Therefore, Levitt and Jacques (2005) have stressed that counselor educators and supervisors need to recognize the importance of trainees’ needs in regard to identity development and to assist them in its development (Cummins, 2009).

To facilitate the development of professional identity, various models have been proposed (Gibson et al, 2010; Loganbill, Hardy, & Delworth, 1982). These models can be primarily grouped into two paradigms: stage-wise development and process development

(Gibson et al., 2010; Loganbill et al., 1982; Moss, Gibson, & Dollarhide, 2014; Stoltenberg, 1981). The stage-wise development paradigm suggests that trainees form a professional identity in stages. Several stage models have been proposed - for example, Stoltenberg (1981) developed a four-stage model (dependent on supervisor, dependency-autonomy conflict, conditional dependency, and being a master counselor), whilst Loganbill et al. (1982) posited that counselor development takes place in three stages (stagnation, confusion and integration).

PID can also be viewed within a process development paradigm with intrapersonal and interpersonal processes involved (Gibson et al., 2010). Gibson et al. (2010) and Moss et al. (2014) proposed that PID moves from a need for external validation to self-validation through the completion of various transformational tasks, including an internalized definition of counseling, transformation from idealism to realism, internalized responsibility for professional growth, burnout to rejuvenation, and a systemic identity integrated within the professional community. PID is considered to involve a transformative learning process in which a counselor trainee or a new professional experiences fluctuations between dependence and autonomy, while seeking professional growth and internal validation in the realms of interpersonal and intrapersonal perspectives through cycles of reflections (Auxier et al., 2003).

Transformative learning processes refer to the expansion of awareness through the change of worldview and frames of reference by critically examining and reflecting on one's beliefs, values and underlying assumptions (Elias, 1997). De Weerd, Bouwen, Corthouts, and Martens (2006) stressed the importance of transformative learning in PID

through integrating previous elements of identity and knowledge with new information, stimulating the growth of a richer professional identity.

Current PID Approaches and Limitations

Counselor trainees or new professionals may experience a variety of challenges in the course of their PID. These challenges include, but are not limited to, high academic and professional expectations; continuous emphasis on self-awareness of personal values and biases; and self-doubts regarding clinical skills and competency (Howard, Inman, & Altman, 2006; Rust, Raskin, & Hill, 2013; Schure, Christopher, & Christopher, 2008; Vilardaga et al., 2011). In addition, constant exposure to professional evaluation and appraisal resulting from intense emotional and evaluative interactions with clients and supervisors, prompts a counselor-in-training to consistently review internal boundaries and perceptions (Birnbaum, 2008). These challenges could yield stress, burnout, and a tendency to focus on external validation (Skovholt, Grier, & Hanson, 2001), and a failure to integrate the individual and professional aspects of identity into a holistic identity (Shuler & Keller-Dupree, 2015). Therefore, Clouder (2005) recommended that educators reconsider approaches on how they prepare trainees for the realities of the profession, and reevaluate what is currently taught related to PID.

Current approaches to enhancing PID include didactic courses, field experiences, supervision, validations, and continuous learning (Gibson et al, 2010; Moss et al., 2014). These strategies are important in terms of enhancing clinical skills and competence, but also carry limitations. First, most of the current strategies for PID do not adequately address self-care training and the challenges students face in the course of PID (Christopher, Christopher, Dunnagan, & Schure, 2006). CACREP's standards highlight

the importance of self-care (CACREP, 2016). Without adequately addressing such issues, trainees and professionals may not be able to integrate personal attributes into their professional training, thus impeding the development of professional identity.

Second, most of the current approaches to PID primarily focus on development of CACREP-required knowledge and skills. Counselors must undergo not only cognitive development, focusing on skills and knowledge about the field, but also affective development in order to relate to and help clients on an emotional level (Mayes, Dollarhide, Marshall, & Rae, 2016). In a similar vein, Clouder (2005) emphasized the importance of students' affective development, and highlighted that PID should include this dimension.

Collectively, these strategies on PID focus on completion of various transformational tasks (dealing with transitions from idealism to realism, burnout to rejuvenation, external validation to international validation, and the integration of personal and professional identities) through didactic courses, field experiences and supervision. We propose that mindfulness principles and practices may complement these approaches and enhance counselors' experience of PID.

Shapiro, Carlson, Astin and Freedman (2006) discussed the transformational effects of mindfulness through the IAA conceptual framework, entailing intention, attention and attitude. According to Shapiro et al. (2006), the mechanism of mindfulness suggests that "intentionally attending moment by moment with openness and nonjudgmentalness" accounts directly or indirectly for transformation through mindfulness practices, leading to significant shift in perspective (i.e. re-perceiving). The shift in perspectives (i.e. an increasing capacity for objectivity in relationship to one's

internal and external experience) enables a person to experience even strong emotions with greater objectivity and less reactivity. This shift in perspectives has been considered as key to development and growth across the lifespan (Kegan, 1982). According to Shapiro et al. (2006), mindfulness is instrumental to continue and accelerate the process of this shift in perspectives.

Multiple studies have highlighted the importance of integrating mindfulness into PID, in such fields as social work (Birnbaum, 2008), teacher education (Korthagen & Vasalos, 2009) and legal education (Jacobowitz & Rogers, 2014). For example, Martin (2014) called for a need to integrate mindfulness into legal education, emphasizing the benefits that doing so could have in encouraging emotional intelligence, and enhancing self-knowledge, empathy, kindness and interpersonal skills. However, no exploration has been conducted to examine the relationship between mindfulness and PID in the counseling field.

Mindfulness and PID

Mindfulness is defined as "the awareness that emerges through paying attention on purpose, in the present moment, and nonjudgmentally to the unfolding of experience moment by moment" (Kabat-Zinn, 2003, p.145). Such a definition of mindfulness has several components. The first involves the self-regulation of attention (to internal experience or external experience) so that it is maintained on immediate experience. The second component involves adopting a particular orientation (curiosity, openness, and acceptance) toward one's experiences in the present moment (Bishop et al., 2004). Additionally, the definition includes a non-judgmental stance, which refers to one's

ability to face unpleasant experiences, and maintain an open and compassionate attitude and a reflective position.

Mindfulness practices facilitate a sense of being alive in the moment and having complete acceptance without judgement in that moment (Dimidjian & Linehan, 2009). Mindfulness practices also serve to reduce negativity, increasing awareness of cognitive patterns, and reducing focus on distractions, while also increasing productivity (Bieling, Antony, & Beck, 2003). Mindfulness practice can be either formal or informal. Some common practices include a body scan (i.e., heightening awareness of physical sensation and reduction of stress), mindfulness meditation, and mindful breathing, moving and eating (Bieling et al., 2003; Bolton, 2014; Shuler & Keller-Dupree, 2015).

Mindfulness has been tied to professional identity through reflective practices and transformative processes (Birnbaum, 2008; Jacobowitz & Rogers, 2014). Self-reflection and introspection, important components both in mindfulness and transformative learning, are not only necessary to the development of a professional identity but also enables practitioners to do their job better (Elias, 1997; Hamilton, 2008). De Weerd et al. (2006) viewed reflection as a significant mediator between experiential learning and identity development. Several methods, such as receiving feedback from supervisors and friends and taking psychometric tests, may foster self-awareness (Tjan, 2015). Mindfulness practice, which may supplement these steps, involves enhancing introspection and perception of our everyday experiences (Baer, 2017). We suggest that mindfulness may lead to greater concentration and insight regarding both personal characteristics and traits, and the world around us. Mindfulness has been found to increase tolerance for cognitive dissonance associated with finding that one carries biases

and preconceptions that are inconsistent with an idealized self, and encourages acceptance of self and others as they actually are, rather than as we imagine them to be (Yeager & Bauer-Wu, 2014). By reflecting on the self in a continuous manner, practitioners are better able to listen attentively, recognize their own errors and values, refine their skills, and make evidence-based decisions (Hamilton, 2008).

Although a few studies have examined the relationship between mindfulness and PID in other disciplines (Birnbaum, 2008; Jacobowitz & Rogers, 2014; Martin, 2014), no exploration has been conducted to examine its potential impact on achieving the transformational tasks in PID through a transformative learning process. The mere performance of transformational tasks does not necessarily lead to transformative learning.

Mindfulness practices, which promote non-judgmental recognition of the biases one may hold in response to differences such as race, ethnicity, gender, or sexual orientation, promote a compassionate acknowledgement of tendencies to be reactive rather than intentional in relation to others (Wilder, n.d.). Unacknowledged, these tendencies may hamper both personal and professional identity development.

Transformative learning, focusing on development of the whole person, may be enhanced by application of mindfulness principles in facing these challenges, rather than accepting experiences and information without query (Bramming, 2007). Thus, the purpose of this conceptual article is to explore the potential impact of mindfulness on achieving the transformational tasks involved in PID. We propose that mindfulness would be instrumental in facilitating the successful completion of transformational tasks through a transformative learning process. The following sections will describe the application of

mindfulness practices in assisting counselor trainees and professionals to enhance their PID in the course of completing transformational tasks: dealing with transitions from idealism to realism, from burnout to rejuvenation, from external validation to internal validation, and in the integration of personal and professional identities.

Application of Mindfulness in PID

Dealing with Transition from Idealism to Realism

A counselor trainee or a new professional cannot be expected to grow in PID without the willingness and ability to face the various complicated realities in the field (Gibson et al., 2010; Moss et al. 2014). According to Moss and colleagues (2014), moving from idealism to realism is an important task in PID, including creating a personal definition of counseling, reliance on one's own experiences, and moving to an internal locus of control.

Trainees and new professionals tend to have idealistic expectations in facing the realities of the counseling arena such as those involving their professional capabilities and roles, the counseling process, and therapeutic relationships (Birnbaum, 2008;Thompson, Frick, Trice-Black, 2011). Many assume that their efforts with their clients will turn into notable effects, and that they will be able to fix all the clients' issues (Howard et al., 2006). Furthermore, new professionals tend to think that counseling sessions should be conducted in a structured or ideal manner, especially for those who have been trained in cognitive-behavioral therapy, solution-focused therapy, or brief strategic therapy under managed care systems (Cushman & Gilford, 2000).

The often unrealistically high expectations about one's role as a counselor tend to create fears about challenging aspects of engagement, such as resistance or silence from,

or confrontation with clients during counseling sessions. For example, people exposed to intimidating or challenging situations often tend to avoid or move away from discomfort, sometimes at great cost (Christopher & Maris, 2010; Kabat-Zinn, 1994). In addition, such unrealistic expectations can lead to a craving for certainty and imposing control on the counseling process (Cushman & Gilford, 2000), which could negatively impact the egalitarian and therapeutic relationship between counselor and client. Each of these elements could negatively impact counselors' perceptions about their abilities to establish working relationships with others, which in turn, could impact their PID.

Mindfulness approaches may help trainees and new professionals to address unrealistic expectations, and have the courage and ability to face realities in the field. Managing emotionally charged situations such as resistance, confrontation and silence in counseling sessions through mindfulness practices (e.g., taking a moment to pause and re-center in the session) may reveal the sources of and responses to fears, such as the impulses of fight or flight in crisis situations (Kabat-Zinn, 1994). This work could increase one's capacity to remain present and aware in the face of stressful emotions and critical situations (Christopher & Maris, 2010). Mindfulness practices may also reduce discomfort in counseling sessions through recognizing the common fear of not knowing everything or enough, and accepting one's own feelings of incompetence or inner emptiness (Christopher & Maris, 2010). The ability to access inner experience with increased clarity and non-reactivity will help counselors reduce fears of inadequacy and incompetence, and thereby diminish fight or flight impulses.

As counselors' abilities to be aware and accepting increase in the course of developing counseling experience, there is typically a reduced need to be "in control" at

each moment. Thus, the counselor would feel less internal pressure to “know it all”, to be “right”, or to be perfect (Christopher & Maris, 2010; Crane & Elias, 2006; Stanley et al., 2006). This shift could result in new abilities and the freedom to fully explore clients’ emotions and experiences without having to understand them fully and fit them neatly into a predetermined conceptual framework (Christopher & Maris, 2010).

Mindfulness practices typically help counselors learn to let go of control and be open to the unpredictable nature of counseling.

Mindfulness can also foster a more egalitarian conceptualization of the therapeutic relationship through focusing on the inter-connectedness of the here-and-now involving a helping professional and a client engaged in a mutual process of exploration. Pollak, Pedulla, and Siegel (2016) suggest a loving-kindness meditation (i.e., a meditation of care, love, tenderness, and a feeling of warmth for oneself and others without condition) for clinicians that could bolster egalitarian and therapeutic relationships with clients. In addition, such questions as “Why have I been assigned this particular client, and why now? What am I supposed to be learning from this person; what personal and spiritual challenge can I recognize and grow through in the moment and in this relationship?” (Birnbaum, 2008, p.849), would help professionals to be more cognizant of the nature of the egalitarian relationship in counseling sessions, and explore the meaning of any given relationship for them from new perspectives. By being open to the new perspectives, counselors are likely to encounter less resistance and improve both their PID and ability to help their clients.

Burnout to Rejuvenation

Remaining rejuvenated and preventing burnout is pivotal for PID. Counselor trainees and new professionals tend to be at high risk for burnout considering the high academic demands, heavy caseloads, and challenges to balancing their own growth as counselors while assisting clients (Skovholt et al., 2001; Thompson et al., 2011). Burnout, if it occurs, can harm counselor trainees and professionals in terms of diminished moral and job satisfaction, higher rates of mental/physical health issues and job turnover (Jenaro, Flores, & Arias, 2007; Oser, Biebel, Pullen, & Harp, 2013). Thus, it is important for counselors to work at staying rejuvenated. The goal is to help trainees develop a professional identity integrated with compassion for self and others through connecting intrapersonally with themselves, and interpersonally with clients and colleagues.

Mindfulness practices, through self-care, may increase physical strength, flexibility, fluidity, balance, and energy (Christopher et al, 2006; Schure et al., 2008). According to Christopher et al. (2006), participants who practiced mindfulness developed increased awareness of their body, increased mental clarity and concentration, and increased tolerance of physical and emotional pains. Furthermore, mindfulness training can increase self-awareness and enhance emotional support in addressing work and academic stressors (Birnbaum, 2008). Mindfulness practices equip practitioners with the ability to remain relaxed and focused (Jensen, Vangkilde, Frokjaer,, & Hasselbalch, 2012). The ability pause and re-center in the session actually lowers experiences of distress by activating the parasympathetic nervous system (Sapolsky, 1998), which can help to reduce burnout and help individuals to stay rejuvenated.

Mindfulness practices (such as undertaking body scans or taking moments to pause) could offer a helpful avenue to achieve the goals of preventing or reducing burnout. Body scans help bring attention to the sensations of breath and one's physical state (e.g. relaxed, or tense), and open the mind to acknowledging whatever is experienced without rejection or fear. Following mindfulness training, counselors may experience distractions in sessions without judging them or engaging in discursive thinking. If the mind starts to wander, the counselor can redirect his/her attention, firmly and gently. Through these practices, counselors can learn to attend to tensions in the body and how to let go and breathe more fully.

As an example, the mindful pause exercise (The Mindful Pause Exercise, 2015) is a short mindfulness technique that can be incorporated into a busy work schedule and help counselors to relax and be mindful while at work. This technique can help individuals be more aware both internally and externally. The exercise requires the individuals to: take a deep breath, notice thoughts, feelings and impulses, and then take another deep breath to consider what is going on around themselves and in their interactions with others. This can help counselor trainees be more aware of themselves and their environments, helping them to act proactively rather than reactively. Through mindfulness practices, developing counselors can recognize their inner ability to rejuvenate and achieve congruency between their personal and professional lives.

Compartmentalization to Integration

Connection with professional identity is strengthened through a stronger awareness of an integrated self (Senge, Scharmer, Jaworski, & Flowers, 2004). This highlights the importance of integration between the professional and the personal

aspects in PID (Intrator & Kunzman, 2006). Counselor trainees and new professionals tend to separate their professional and personal identities. They believe that they could put on a “professional self” in the workplace and switch to a “personal self” in their private lives (Morrow et al, 2011). Though this strategy may seemingly help professionals to overcome difficult moments in their professional and personal lives, it also risks generating friction in professional identity wherein the personal and professional selves become detached (Beijaard, Meijer & Verloop, 2004). This unsuccessful resolution of the discordance between personal self and professional self could serve as a barrier to PID.

Mindfulness could help with the integration of professional self and personal self. When approached with intention, mindfulness is not a practice detached from broader meaning. Rather, it is a way of integrating or achieving an holistic state of being that permeates daily life (Salzberg & Goldstein, 2001). Counseling professionals cannot be wholly congruent and effectively connect (both cognitively and emotionally) with clients unless they are consistently aware and accepting of their own internal and external processes (Lum, 2002). The non-judgmental and attentive aspects of mindfulness may help counselor trainees and new professionals to be aware of and keep abreast with new trends and directions in the profession without holding a judgmental attitude toward the new changes (such as the merging of professional accreditation bodies, and rules under the managed cared systems). This may help prevent them from forming a dualist view of the changes, either good or bad. Rather mindfulness may help them to become increasingly cognitively complex, more aware of the inner voice in themselves as well as aware of the contexts for the changes, each of which may help counselor trainees resist

the impulses to “solve” issues and foster acceptance of the uncertainty of life. As counselors develop habits of mindfulness (i.e., acceptance, regulation of emotion, and the ability to stay with the current situation), they become better equipped to infuse professional identity into the fabric of their life and personal identity (Rothaupt & Morgan, 2007).

Specific mindfulness practices and goals such as re-perceiving may help to encourage integration further contributing to PID. Re-perceiving occurs when people shift their perceptions through use of mindfulness techniques. This technique can be used to integrate the professional and personal self as it may “facilitate more adaptive, flexible responding to the environment in contrast to the more rigid, reflexive patterns of reactivity that result from being overly identified with one’s current experience” (Shapiro, Carlson, Astin, & Freedman, 2006, p. 381). According to Shapiro and colleagues (2006) self-regulation is one way to achieve re-perceiving and is based on feedback loops that encourage practitioners to maintain stability and adapt to change. By creating periods of intention and attention, individuals can work to re-perceive their separate identities, increase flexibility and decrease the rigid lines separating those identities, thus integrating the professional and personal into one self-identity.

External to Internal Validation

Both Gibson et al. (2010) and Moss et al. (2014) have described a process perspective of PID as a movement from external validation to internal validation. Evaluation is a normal part of the process in counseling and supervision. However, evaluation can be deemed as daunting and catastrophic when counselor trainees and new counselors tend to judge themselves based upon external evaluation, or view supervisors’

skills from a static outcome perspective. Although evidence exists that significant others (such as clients and supervisors) form their evaluations based on their past experiences and needs, a counselor being evaluated tends to believe that others' evaluations are always factual and objective (Carson & Langer, 2006). If an individual is not being mindful, then he or she may simply equate others' judgments as invincible truth, and form negative self-evaluations. Counselor trainees may falsely believe that they will never be able to develop to the level of their supervisors' clinical skills without recognizing that their supervisors also had gone through the same developmental process. This mode of thinking can lead to trainees holding the belief that their supervisors will reject them. In addition, individuals who live without mindful attention tend to detach from the here-and-now and focus their attentional resources on impressing others by putting up a pleasing front and behaving the way others think they should act, think, or behave in a given situation (Carson & Langer, 2006). Lack of mindfulness can undermine self-acceptance in new counselors and trainees while also triggering self-critique due to orientation of external validation, which can negatively impact PID. Contrary to external validation, internal validation is highly associated with self-acceptance (Hall, 2014). According to Carson and Langer (2006), self-acceptance refers to one's ability and willingness to experience mindfully, which entails experiencing fully in the here-and-now, letting others view one's true self, and living daily life without pretense or excessive attention to how he or she is coming across to others.

Mindfulness includes a compassionate and non-judgmental attitude that is considered essential for the development of self-acceptance (Birnbaum, 2008). The mindfulness perspective could help counselors focus on the therapeutic and supervision

processes rather than just focusing on end goals. This could reduce the negative effect of social comparison, help trainees and new professionals view counseling skills development from a process perspective, and allow them to see that the qualities or skills of others do not diminish their own worth as individuals. The individuals will also realize that they have the opportunity to learn new techniques, and therefore are not stupid or inferior, but simply have not had the occasion to learn the technique yet. Furthermore, Kabat-Zinn (2003) described mindfulness as including an affectionate and compassionate quality with a sense of openheartedness, friendly presence, and interest. Ascribing to these approaches can help engender a life-long career of learning and personal growth. Mindfulness practice has been shown to facilitate an internalized view through attunement of self instead of a reliance on external opinions (Kristeller, 2007; Lazar et al., 2005). According to Birnbaum (2008), "...mindfulness meditation can, in the long run, enhance self-containment from within rather than relying on external containment provided by the group" (p. 844).

Mindful-Based Stress Reduction programs and Qigong (an ancient Chinese health care promotion technique that integrates physical postures, breathing techniques and focused intention) may lead to an increase in self-compassion and self-acceptance, facilitating greater appreciation of one's imperfections and limitations (Chrisman, Christopher, & Lichtenstein, 2009; Shapiro, Brown, & Biegel, 2007). To achieve the transformational task of moving from external validation to internal validation during PID, mindfulness-based values clarification can be utilized by trainees and professionals alike. According to Shapiro and colleagues (2006), values clarification technique is a form of re-perceiving. Individual values are created through the life-long process of

socialization and influences from personal experiences, cultural background and family. Through value clarification the practitioner is encouraged to reflect upon the context and importance of ingrained values with greater objectivity. Blind acceptance of values from external sources has been shown to limit consideration of more congruent options (Shapiro et al., 2006). This blind acceptance of external values and standards for the self could be potentially harmful to both counselors and their clients. While mindfulness skills are not designed to change anything, the observation and awareness promoted by these techniques challenge harmful and maladaptive cognitive patterns (Robins, 2002), such as comparing oneself to unreasonable standards through external validation.

Implications

The 2016 CACREP standards highlight the important role of PID in training professional counselors. Considering the potential impact of mindfulness in achieving transformative tasks in PID, counselor educators may consider integrating mindfulness strategies to enhance PID. Counselor educators need to keep abreast of the updated research in the fields of mindfulness and PID, and stimulate trainees' interests in these areas by introducing the latest literature and practices to trainees. Ongoing practice of mindfulness is important for developing an experiential understanding of the impact of mindfulness practices on PID. Counselor educators may need to engage in mindfulness training, which could help them to explain to trainees the caveats and pitfalls during mindfulness practices (Kabat-Zinn, 2003), and impacts of mindfulness on PID. If counselor educators do not have mindfulness training, they may consider collaborating with individuals who have the expertise to conduct the training.

Practicing mindfulness approaches (including related practices such as TaiChi, QiGong, meditation, yoga) inside and outside of class may help students to reflect on these experiential activities and the impact on their professional development through strategies such as journaling and group discussion. Because mindfulness can be new to trainees, the sharing activities could serve to explain the challenging and delicate aspects of mindfulness approaches, and the exchange of ideas on how to improve their practices to best support their PID. Though mindfulness practices have been found to work well with various cultural groups, it may not work for all personalities and therapeutic styles. Counselor educators and professionals should examine if mindfulness practices align with their own worldviews or belief systems. It is extremely important to examine the distinction between the religious/spiritual and pragmatic aspects of mindfulness practices. Trainees and professionals should not be put into the situation in which they feel they are forced into religious/spiritual practices against their beliefs (Caldwell, 2011).

Future research needs to be conducted to examine the effects of mindfulness on PID among counselors. Since PID is a long process, counselor educators may need to implement longitudinal and experimental studies to examine the impacts of mindfulness training on future career outcomes such as multicultural competency or job satisfaction. In addition, future research is needed to examine mechanisms through which mindfulness works in fostering PID. For example, researchers could examine the impact of mindfulness on achieving transformational tasks. The results could inform counselor education programs on appropriate mindfulness strategies to effectively enhance PID.

References

- Auxier, C., Hughes, F. R., & Kline, W. B. (2003). Identity development in counselors-in-training. *Counselor Education & Supervision, 43*, 25-38.
- Baer, D. (2017, April 12). The father of mindfulness on what mindfulness has become: An interview with Jon Kabat-Zinn, creator of mindfulness-based stress reduction [Blog post] Retrieved from <https://journal.thriveglobal.com/the-father-of-mindfulness-on-what-mindfulness-has-become-ad649c8340cf>
- Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 20*, 107–128.
doi:org/10.1016/j.tate.2003.07.001
- Bieling, P. J., Antony, M. M., & Beck, A. T. (2003). Ending the depression cycle: A step-by-step guide for preventing relapse . Oakland, CA: New Harbinger Publications.
- Birnbaum, L. (2008). The use of mindfulness training to create an “Accompanying Place” for social work students. *Social Work Education, 27*, 837– 852.
doi:10.1080/02615470701538330
- Bishop, S. R., Lau, M., Shapiro, S., Carlson, L., Anderson, N. D., Carmody, J., ... & Devins, G. (2004). Mindfulness: A proposed operational definition. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice, 11*, 230-241. doi: 10.1093/clipsy.bph077
- Bolton, G. (2005) Reflective practice: Writing and professional development. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Bramming, P. (2007). An argument for strong learning in higher education. *Quality in Higher Education, 13*, 45-56. doi:10.1080/13538320701272722

- Brott, P. E. (2006). Counselor education accountability: Training the effective professional school counselor. *Professional School Counseling*, 10, 179-188. doi:10.5330/prsc.10.2.d61g0v3738863652
- Carson, S. H., & Langer, E. J. (2006). Mindfulness and self-acceptance. *Journal of Rational-Emotive and Cognitive-Behavior Therapy*, 24, 29-43. doi:10.1007/s10942-006-0022-5
- Caldwell, K. L. (2012). Mindfulness matters: Practices for counselors and counselor education. *Ideas and Research You Can Use: VISTAS*, 1, 1-9.
- Chrisman, J. A., Christopher, J. C., & Lichtenstein, S. J. (2009). Qigong as a mindfulness practice for counseling students: A qualitative study. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 49, 236-257. doi:10.1177/0022167808327750
- Christopher, J. C., Christopher, S. E., Dunnagan, T., & Schure, M. (2006). Teaching self-care through mindfulness practices: The application of yoga, meditation, and qigong to counselor training. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 46, 494-509. doi:10.1177/0022167806290215
- Christopher, J. C., & Maris, J. A. (2010). Integrating mindfulness as self-care into counseling and psychotherapy training. *Counseling and Psychotherapy Research*, 10, 114-125. doi: 10.1080/14733141003750285
- Clouder, L. (2005). Caring as a 'threshold concept': Transforming students in higher education into health(care) professionals. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 10, 505-517. doi: 10.1080/13562510500239141
- Corey, G., Corey, M. S., & Callanan, P. (2010). *Issues and ethics in the helping professions* (8th ed.). Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole.

- Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (2016). 2016 CACREP standards. Retrieved from <http://www.cacrep.org/for-programs/2016-cacrep-standards/>
- Crane, R., & Elias, D. (2006). Being with what is. *Therapy Today*, 17(10), 31-33.
- Cummins, D. (2009). The role of practicum and intern supervisees in PID (Doctoral dissertation). University of New Orleans. Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3361216).
- Cushman, P., & Gilford, P. (2000). Will managed care change our way of being? *American Psychologist*, 55, 985-996. doi: 10.1037/0003-066X.55.9.985
- De Weerd, S., Bouwen, R., Corthouts, F., & Martens, H. (2006). Identity transformation as an intercontextual process. *Industry & Higher Education*, 20, 317-326. doi: 10.4135/9781452243177
- Dimidjian, S., & Linehan, M. M. (2009). Mindfulness practice. In W. T. O'Donohue & J. E. Fisher (Eds.), *General principles and empirically supported techniques of cognitive behavior therapy*, (pp. 425- 433). Hoboken, N. J.: John Wiley & Sons.
- Elias, D. (1997). It's time to change our minds: An introduction to transformative learning. *ReVision*, 20(1), 2-7.
- Gibson, D. M, Dollarhide, C. T., & Moss, J. M. (2010). Professional identity development: A grounded theory of transformational tasks of new counselors. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 50, 21-37. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2010.tb00106.x
- Granello, D.H., & Young, M.E.(2012). *Counseling today: Foundations of professional identity*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.

- Hall, K. (2014, July). Self-validation: How to accept your internal experience. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.sott.net/article/315749-Self-validation-How-to-accept-your-internal-experience>
- Hamilton, N. W. (2008). Assessing professionalism: Measuring progress in the formation of an ethical professional identity. *University of St. Thomas Law Journal*, 5, 470-511.
- Howard, E. E., Inman, A. G., & Altman, A. N. (2006). Critical incidents among novice counselor trainees. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 46, 88-102.
- Intrator, S. M., & Kunzman, R. (2006). Starting with the soul. *Educational Leadership*, 63(6), 39-42.
- Jacobowitz, J. L., & Rogers, S. (2014). Mindful ethics: A pedagogical and practical approach to teaching legal ethics, developing professional identity, and encouraging civility. *St.Mary's Law Journal*, 4, 198-241.
- Jenaro, C., Flores, N., & Arias, B. (2007). Burnout and coping in human service practitioners. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 38, 80–87. doi:10.1037/0735-7028.38.1.80
- Jensen, C. G., Vangkilde, S., Frokjaer, V., & Hasselbalch, S. G. (2012). Mindfulness training affects attention—Or is it attentional effort? *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General*, 141, 106-123. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a0024931>
- Kabat-Zinn, J. (1994). *Wherever you go, there you are: Mindfulness meditation in everyday life*. New York, NY: Hyperion.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. (2003). Mindfulness-based interventions in context: Past, present, and future. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice*, 10, 144-156.

- Korthagen, F., & Vasalos, A. (2005). Levels in reflection: Core reflection as a means to enhance professional growth. *Teachers and Teacher Education: Theory and Practice*, 11, 47-71.
- Kristeller, J. L. (2007). Mindfulness meditation. *Principles and Practice of Stress Management*, 3, 393-427.
- Lazar, S. W., Kerr, C. E., Wasserman, R. H., Gray, J. R., Greve, D. N., Treadway, M. T., & Fischal, B. (2005). Meditation experience is associated with increased cortical thickness. *Neuroreport: For Rapid Communication of Neuroscience Research*, 16, 1893-1897.
- Levitt, D. H., & Jacques, J. D. (2005). Promoting tolerance for ambiguity in counselor training programs. *Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education and Development*, 44, 46-54.
- Loganbill, C., Hardy, E., & Delworth, U. (1982). Supervision: A conceptual model. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 10 (1), 3-42.
- Luke, M., & Goodrich, K. M. (2010). Chi Sigma Iota chapter leadership and professional identity development in early career counselors. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 50, 56-78.
- Lum, W. (2002). The use of self of the therapist. *Contemporary Family Therapy*, 24, 181-197.
- Martin, N. (2014). Think like a (mindful) lawyer: Incorporating mindfulness, professional identity, and emotional intelligence into the first year law curriculum. *University of Arkansas at Little Rock Law Review*, 36, 413-451.

- Mayes, R. D., Dollarhide, C. T., Marshall, B., & Rae, A. (2016). Affective and developmental transitions: qualitative themes in multicultural counseling journals. *The International Journal of Information and Learning Technology*, 33, 2-16.
- Morrow, G., Burford, B., Rothwell, C., Carter, M., McLachlan, J., & Illing, J. (2011). Professionalism in healthcare professionals. Report to the Health and Care Professions Council. London: HCPC.
- Moss, J. M., Gibson, D. M., & Dollarhide, C. T. (2014). Professional identity development: A grounded theory of transformational tasks of counselors. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 92, 3-12.
- Oser, C. B., Biebel, E. P., Pullen, E., & Harp, K. L. (2013). Causes, consequences, and prevention of burnout among substance abuse treatment counselors: A rural versus urban comparison. *Journal of Psychoactive Drugs*, 45, 17-27.
- Pistole, M. C., & Roberts, A. (2002). Mental health counseling: Toward resolving identity confusions. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 24, 1-19.
- Pollak, S. M., Pedulla, T., & Siegel, R. D. (2016). *Sitting together: Essential skills for mindfulness-based psychotherapy*. New York, NY: Guilford Press.
- Robins, C. J. (2002). Zen principles and mindfulness practice in dialectical behavior therapy. *Cognitive and Behavioral Practice*, 9, 50-57. doi:1077-7229/02/50-5751.00/0
- Rothaupt, J. W., & Morgan, M. M. (2007). Counselors' and counselor educators' practice of mindfulness: A qualitative inquiry. *Counseling and Values*, 52, 40-54.

- Rust, J. P., Raskin, J. D., & Hill, M. S. (2013). Problems of professional competence among counselor trainees: programmatic issues and guidelines. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 52*, 30-52. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2013.00026.x
- Salzberg, S., & Goldstein, J. (2001). *Insight meditation workbook*. Boulder, CO: Sounds True.
- Sapolsky, R. M. (1998). *Why zebras don't get ulcers: A guide to stress, stress-related disorders and coping*. New York, NY: Henry Holt.
- Schure, M. B., Christopher, J., & Christopher, S. (2008). Mind–body medicine and the art of self-care: Teaching mindfulness to counseling students through yoga, meditation, and qigong. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 86*, 47-56.
- Senge, P. M., Scharmer, C. O., Jaworski, J., & Flowers, B. S. (2004). *Presence: An exploration of profound change in people, organizations, and society*. Cambridge, MA: Society for Organizational Learning.
- Shapiro, S. L., Brown, K. W., & Biegel, G. M. (2007). Teaching self-care to caregivers: effects of mindfulness-based stress reduction on the mental health of therapists in training. *Training and Education in Professional Psychology, 1*, 105-115
- Shapiro, S. L., Carlson, L. E., Astin, J. A., & Freedman, B. (2006). Mechanisms of Mindfulness. *Journal of Clinical Psychology, 62*, 373-386.
doi:10.1002/jclp.20237
- Shuler, M. K., & Keller-Dupree, E. A. (2015). The impact of transformational learning experiences on personal and professional counselor-in-training identity development. *The Professional Counselor, 5*, 152-162. doi:10.1524/mks.5.1.152.
- Skovholt, T. M., Grier, T. L., & Hanson, M. R. (2001). Career counseling for longevity:

- Self-care and burnout prevention strategies for counselor resilience. *Journal of Career Development*, 27, 167–176. doi:10.1177/089484530102700303
- Stanley, S., Reitzel, L. R., Wingate, L. R., Cukrowicz, K. C., Lima, E. N., & Joiner, T. E., Jr. (2006). Mindfulness: A primrose path for therapists using manualized treatments? *Journal of Cognitive Psychotherapy: An International Quarterly*, 20, 327-335. doi:10.1891/jcop.20.3.327
- Stoltenberg, C. D. (1981). Approaching supervision from a developmental perspective: The counselor complexity model. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 28, 59-65.
- Studer, J. R. (2007). Erik Erikson's psychosocial stages applied to supervision. *Guidance & Counseling*, 21, 168-173.
- The Mindful Pause Exercise. (2015). In University of Wisconsin Department of Psychiatry. Retrieved from http://www.psychiatry.wisc.edu/uwpMindfulness_pause.html
- Thompson, H., Frick, M. H., & Trice-Black, S. (2011). Counselor-in-training perceptions of supervision practices related to self-care and burnout. *The Professional Counselor*, 1, 152-162.
- Tjan, A. K. (2015). Five ways to become more self-aware. Retrieved from <https://hbr.org/2015/02/5-ways-to-become-more-self-aware>
- Vilardaga, R., Luoma, J. B., Hayes, S. C., Pistorello, J., Levin, M. E., Hildebrandt, ... & Bond, F. (2011). Burnout among the addiction counseling workforce: The differential roles of mindfulness and values-based processes and work-site factors. *Journal of Substance Abuse Treatment*, 40, 323-335. doi:10.1016/j.jsat.2010.11.015

Wilder, T. (n.d.). Mindfulness & bias:Literature review. Retrieved from

<https://medium.com/inclusion-insights/mindfulness-bias-literature-review-3e4a9993cb41>

Yeager, K. A., & Bauer-Wu, S. (2014). Cultural humility: Essential foundation for clinical researchers. *Applied Nursing Research*, 26, 251-256.

<https://dx.doi.org/10.1016%2Fj.apnr.2013.06.008>