
Jesse Acker-Johnson
FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF MUSIC

A GUIDE TO THE INTERPRETATION OF JOHN DOWLAND’S “QUEEN ELIZABETH’S
GALLIARD P. 41,” “LACHRIMAE PAVAN P. 15,” “FAREWELL FANTASY P. 3,” and “FORLORN
HOPE FANCY P. 2” TRANSCRIBED FOR GUITAR

By
JESSE ACKER-JOHNSON

A Treatise submitted to the
College of Music
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Music

Degree awarded:
Spring Semester 2015
Jesse Acker-Johnson defended this treatise on April 15, 2015.

The members of the supervisory committee were:

Bruce Holzman
Professor Directing Treatise

Charles Brewer
University Representative

Pamela Ryan
Committee Member

Ben Sung
Committee Member

The Graduate School has approved the above-named committee members, and certifies that the treatise has been approved in accordance with the university requirements.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This treatise would not be possible without the generous support of the following faculty, family, and friends. I would like to thank the following people who have been vital to this process.

Professor Bruce Holzman, for his acute attention to detail and delightful canniness and canines.

Dr. Charles Brewer, Dr. Pamela Ryan, and Dr. Ben Sung, for serving on my committee and for providing critical insights and support.

My parents David, Debbie, Sheila, Merrick, Mei, and Shyang, for their intelligence, wisdom, passion, and generous support. Your love and kindness will never be forgotten.

To my wife Dr. Jessie Wen-Chieh Lo, for her tenacity and bravery. She is the greatest partner, friend, teacher, and companion in life that I could have ever wanted.

Thanks to KRONEMUIR for his music collection.

Most of all, to my dear Natalie.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Musical Examples......................................................................................................................... v
Abstract....................................................................................................................................................... vii

Chapter 1: Introduction.......................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 2: Biographical Information................................................................................................3

Chapter 3: Historical Context............................................................................................................ 12

Chapter 4: Possible Alterations To The Classical Guitar To Achieve A "Lute-Like" Sound......................... 19

Chapter 5: Agogic Accents.................................................................................................................. 32

Chapter 6: Ornamentation ................................................................................................................. 41

Chapter 7: Renaissance Embellishments..................................................................................... 56

Chapter 8: Conclusion.......................................................................................................................... 65

Bibliography.............................................................................................................................................. 67
Biographical Sketch................................................................................................................................ 70
LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

Example 1: Lute Tuning .....................................................................................................................21
Example 2: Groppo Fingering On A Lute ..........................................................................................22
Example 3: Groppo Fingering On A Guitar ......................................................................................23
Example 4: Mordent In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 ..............................................................................26
Example 5: Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 .................................................................................................27
Example 6: i, m Fingering (Unornamented) ....................................................................................29
Example 7: i, m Fingering (Ornamented) .......................................................................................29
Example 8: p, i Fingering In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 .....................................................................30
Example 9: Groppo Lute Fingering In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 ..........................................................30
Example 10: Groppo Guitar Fingering in Lachrimae Pavan P. 15......................................................31
Example 11: Agogic Accent In Farewell Fantasy P. 3 Applied To First Note Of A Phrase ..................34
Example 12: Farewell Fantasy P. 3 ..................................................................................................35
Example 13: Agogic Accent Applied To A Chord At The Beginning Of A Phrase ......38
Example 14: Applying Agogic Accents To Leaps (1) .....................................................................38
Example 15: Applying Agogic Accents To Leaps (2) .....................................................................39
Example 16: Applying Agogic Accents To Dissonances ...............................................................39
Example 17: Applying Agogic Accents To Modal Shifts ...............................................................40
Example 18: Two Types Of Groppo ...............................................................................................42
Example 19: Cadential Groppo Di Sopra .......................................................................................43
Example 20: Modal Groppo Di Sopra ............................................................................................43
Example 21: Two Types Of Gruppetto ...........................................................................................44
Example 22: Without Grupetto ................................................................. 44
Example 23: With Grupetto ................................................................. 44
Example 24: Slide ............................................................................. 45
Example 25: Without Slide ................................................................. 45
Example 26: With Slide ..................................................................... 45
Example 27: Mordent And Inverted Mordent .................................. 46
Example 28: Without Mordent .......................................................... 46
Example 29: With Mordent ............................................................... 47
Example 30: Without Inverted Mordent ........................................... 47
Example 31: With Inverted Mordent .................................................. 47
Example 32: Appoggiatura With Notated Grace Note .................... 48
Example 33: Appoggiatura Without Notated Grace Note .................. 48
Example 34: Two Types Of Acciaccatura .......................................... 49
Example 35: Overdotting ................................................................. 49
Example 36: Dotting ....................................................................... 49
Example 37: Mm. 28-29 In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 (Straight) ........ 50
Example 38: Use Of Dotting In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 (Dotted) .... 50
Example 39: Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 (Performed By Paul O’Dette) .... 53
Example 40: Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 (Performed By Nigel North) .... 54
Example 41: Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 (Performed By Jakob Lindberg) .... 55
Example 42: Embellishing An Interval Using Virgiliano’s Rules ......... 60
Example 43: Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2 ............................................... 62
Example 44: Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2 Embellishments ..................... 64
ABSTRACT

This treatise shows an array of interpretive possibilities for classical guitarists interested in performing the solo lute works of the renaissance lutenist and composer John Dowland. The treatise emphasizes three points: first, the process by which guitarists become aware of the elements of interpretation in John Dowland’s solo lute music; second, the conscious clarification of interpretive goals and objectives on the part of the guitarist; and third, the methods and techniques used to achieve each goal. Each element of interpretation is applied to an original transcription of Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41, Lachrimae Pavan P. 15, Farewell Fantasy P. 3, and “Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2. The reader will, ultimately, have a framework to engage in the process of interpreting John Dowland’s solo lute work and will also have insight into the interpretive process in general.
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this treatise is threefold: to inform classical guitarists about the interpretive possibilities in John Dowland's solo lute music, to help guitarists clarify their interpretive values and objectives with regard to interpretation, and to give each guitarist the techniques that will allow them to achieve these goals. I will provide the reader the choice of whether their commitment lies toward creating a lute-like sound on the guitar or the pure guitar sound and then show techniques that can create both of these objectives.

This treatise examines four works of music, Lachrimae Pavan P. 15, Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41, Farewell Fantasy P. 3, and Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2, written by the late renaissance lutenist and composer John Dowland. All of the transcriptions from lute tablature to treble clef are original. However, I was greatly assisted in the transcription process by referring to The Collected Lute Music of John Dowland\(^1\) by Diana Poulton and Basil Lam. The goal of this analysis will be to create a comprehensive guide to interpreting the music of John Dowland on the classical guitar. Each of the four Dowland pieces will provide a context for the application of a different element of early music interpretation, e.g., ornamentation, agogic accents, and embellishment. I do not give prescriptive opinions on the necessity of using any of the previous elements of interpretation. If the guitarist’s values and objectives are clear, then interpretive choices can be made easily. However, in

order for a musician’s values to become clear it is important to know what the options for interpretation are. One cannot create an original interpretation of John Dowland’s music on classical guitar without knowing about alterations, agogic accents, ornamentation, and embellishment and making a decision regarding these issues. If a guitarist proceeds without making a conscious decision concerning these interpretive elements the player risks creating a default interpretation that is limited by the performer’s own ignorance.

The treatise will also contain a brief discussion of Dowland’s biography as well as the historical context in which he lived. Insight into Dowland’s biographical details and his place in musical history will reveal the elements from which his compositional style is derived. These discussions will show how exceptionally well-suited Dowland’s work is as a context for the study of early music interpretation for classical guitarists.
CHAPTER 2

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

As Paul O'Dette and Peter Holman have noted, “Dowland wrote in A Pilgrimes Solace (London, 1612) that ‘I am now entered into the fiftieth yeare of mine age’.”² This would place Dowland’s birth at 1563. Very little is known about Dowland’s childhood. Dowland mentions in his The First Booke of Songs or Ayres (London, 1597) that,

The Courtly judgement I hope wil not be seuere against them, being it selfe a party, and those sweet spring of humanity entertain them for his sake, whome they have already grac’t, and as it were enfranchisd in the ingenuous profession of Musicke, which from my childhood I have euer aymed at, sundry times leaving my natieue country, the better to attain so excellent a science.³

This confirms that Dowland was committed to the profession of music from a young age.

There is also very little information available about Dowland's parents. Poulton says,

Where any information can be gathered about the social status of the Dowlands it is noticeable that they belonged to the upper ranks of the artisan class - a mason, a printer, a fisherman and two tailors - and, where wills are extant, the testators have a comfortable amount of personal property to dispose of.⁴

³ Dowland, John. The First Booke of Songs or Ayres of Foure Partes with Tableture for the Lute So Made, That All the Parts Together, or Either of Them Seuerally May Be Sung to the Lute, Orpharian or Viol De Gambo. Composed by Iohn Dowland, Lutenist and Bacheler of Musick in Both the Vniversities. Also an Inuention by the Said Author for Two to Play Vpon One Lute. Newly Corrected and Amended. Ed. Imprinted at London: By Humfrey Lownes, Dwelling on Bredstreet-hill, at the Sign of the Starre, 1613. Print.
It follows that Dowland is likely to have led a comfortable life surrounded by industrious, creative people as a child. His lifestyle would not have been lavish, but he was probably not left wanting for the basic comforts of the period. However, Dowland was apparently unsatisfied with the caste he was born into and had ambition toward notoriety in both his art and person. During his life Dowland was to ascend to a higher social stratum and, due to the prevailing importance of class in Elizabethan England, might have wanted to conceal his humble artisanal origins. Poulton asks, “Was it perhaps a desire that the comparatively humble condition of his family should remain hidden that caused him to maintain such a remarkable reticence about his early years?”

This reluctance to admit biographical details changed as he grew older and Dowland began documenting at length the events of his adult life, mostly in letters, starting around 1580. One interpretation regarding this difference is that Dowland understood the power of creating a persona or public image to the benefit of his career and that his past, including his family, did not fit this narrative.

Dowland left for Paris in 1580 to enter into the service of Sir Henry Cobham, the English ambassador to the French court. He stayed for most of Cobham’s service between 1580-1583 and remained in Paris at least until 1584 with Cobham’s successor, Sir Edward Stafford. A major motivation for traveling to Paris was probably to be close to the most famous lute teachers in Europe. Poulton mentions,

*Adrian Le Roy’s A Briefe and Easye Instruction*, originally printed in Paris in 1567, made its appearance in England in 1568, translated by John Alford and printed by John Kingston. The contents of the Instruction reappeared in several different forms and Le Roy’s method formed the basis of English lute teaching until the early years of the seventeenth century.

---

5 Ibid. 26.
6 Ibid. 26.
Dowland’s experience in Paris must have been formative in many respects. It was his first professional engagement and his chance to solidify his reputation as a musician and person worthy of keeping company with members of high social rank.

As O’dette and Holman have noted, “He admitted in 1595 in a long autobiographical letter to Sir Robert Cecil that he had become a Catholic in France, though he received a BMus at Christ Church, Oxford, on 8 July 1588, which would have involved him subscribing to the Thirty-Nine Articles.”

This would also indicate that Dowland had returned to England to attend Oxford several years before 1588. John Dowland is assumed to have married around 1586 and we know that his son Robert Dowland, author of the influential *A Varietie of Lute Lessons*, was born in 1591. Dowland did have other children but we do not know when they were born. Almost nothing is known about Dowland’s wife including her Christian name. She is obviously a very important person to Dowland as his wife and the mother of his children but Dowland writes very little about her. She is mentioned a few times in Dowland’s letters to Sir Robert Cecil but as Poulton reports, “She is heard of once more, in 1601, and then she vanishes from the scene.”

Religious identity was important in Elizabethan England and Dowland’s subscription to the Thirty-Nine Articles, the creed of the Church of England, would suggest

---


Dowland’s readiness, for purposes of opportunism or not, to adhere to the dominant form of Christianity in England during that time, the Anglican Church. Dowland does state in a letter to Sir Robert Cecil,

...these men thrust many idle toys into my head of religion, saying that the papists’ was the truth & ours in England all false, and I being but young their fair words overreached me & I believed with them.\textsuperscript{10}

Dowland was ultimately successful in connecting with the English court and maintaining a number of valuable contacts. According to Poulton, Dowland did have an occasion to play for Queen Elizabeth in 1592, “While she was on progress in Gloucestershire she visited Sudeley Castle, the home of Giles Bridges, Lord Chandos. One of the customary entertainments was prepared in her honour and was mounted with the usual lavish expenditure.”\textsuperscript{11} Despite Dowland’s connections in the court of Queen Elizabeth, when the royal lutenist John Johnson died in 1594 the position was left vacant. Dowland suspected that his earlier conversion to Catholicism prevented his appointment to the court. In a letter to Sir Robert Cecil in 1595 Dowland attempts to reaffirm his allegiance to Elizabeth’s court,

\begin{quote}
God he knoweth I never loved treason nor trechery nor never knew of any, nor never heared any mass in englande, wh[i]che I finde is great abuse of the peple for on my soule I understande it not, wherefor I hav reformed my self to lyve according to her ma[jes]ties lawes as I was borne under her highnes, & that most humbly I do Crave p[ar]don, p[ro]testinge if ther wer any abylitie in me, I wold be most redy to make amende[s] ...\textsuperscript{12}
\end{quote}

When it became clear to Dowland that his appointment at Queen Elizabeth’s court could not be counted on, he decided to travel with the intent of meeting Luca Marenzio, the

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{11} Ibid. 37.
\textsuperscript{12} Ibid. 39.
\end{flushright}
famous composer of madrigals. *Musica Transalpina*, published in 1588 by Nicholas Yonge, had become famous throughout England by 1594. Marenzio’s work was included in *Musica Transalpina* and featured extensive word painting and chromaticism and proved to be very influential on Dowland’s own compositional style.

Dowland began his journey toward Italy by first responding to an invitation from Heinrich Julius, Duke of Brunswick-Lüneburg at Wolfenbüttel. According to Dowland in a letter to Sir Robert Cecil, the duke offered him a position with a high salary. Dowland did not accept and instead made his way to the court of Moritz, Landgrave of Hesse, along with the Wolfenbüttel lutenist Gregorio Howet. Dowland eventually made his way to Italy and was able to see much of the country. He states in the *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres*, "What fauour and estimation I had in Venice, Padua, Genoa, Ferrara, Florence, & diuers other places I willingly suppresse, least I should any way seem partiall in mine owne indeuours." Dowland was able to meet Giovanni Croce in Venice but was unable to meet with Marenzio in Rome. Dowland was delayed in Florence where he became involved with a circle of English Catholics engaged in treasonous activities. As Holman and O'Dette have stated,

> When he was promised ‘a large pention of the pope, & that his holynes & all the cardinales would make wonderfull mutch of me’, he realized the seriousness of his position, and returned to Kassel by way of Bologna, Venice and Nuremberg without apparently reaching Rome or meeting Marenzio.

---

13 Dowland, John. *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres of Foure Partes with Tableture for the Lute So Made, That All the Parts Together, or Either of Them Severally May Be Sung to the Lute, Orpherian or Viol De Gambo. Composed by Iohn Dowland, Lutenist and Bacheler of Musick in Both the Vniversities. Also an Inuention by the Said Author for Two to Play Vpon One Lute.* Newly Corrected and Amended. Ed. Imprinted at London: By Humfry Lownes, Dwelling on Bredstreet-hill, at the Sign of the Starre, 1613. Print.

Poulton considers that Dowland was “Immensely self-centered and highly emotional” and that “the thought of any rumour of his association with the traitors reaching home must have set him in a fever of anxiety.”\textsuperscript{15} If this is true there would certainly be just cause to worry considering the damage that would be done to his reputation at home and his employability in the English court as well as with other Protestant patrons of suitable means. Dowland’s anxiety may also be an unfounded, exaggerated response or paranoia because Dowland was well thought of by Queen Elizabeth. Holman and O’Dette state that, “The courtier Henry Noel wrote to him at Kassel on 1 December 1596 to tell him that the queen ‘hath wished divers tymes your return’, and to ‘wishe you health & soon return’,”\textsuperscript{16} and Poulton says in regard to the possibility of the queen holding prejudice toward Dowland because he dabbled in Catholicism, “As far as the queen herself was concerned she was no fanatic.”\textsuperscript{17} Evidently, there was another reason why the court lutenist position was not awarded to Dowland but it is not clear from available sources.

In 1597 Dowland published \textit{The First Book of Ayres and Songs} which became an instant success. This gave Dowland the reputation of a leading figure in English musical society. Dowland’s success still did not materialize in a position in England and he was forced to entertain other offers, eventually ending up in the service of Christian IV, king of Denmark in the autumn of 1598. The king must have realized Dowland’s value as a lutenist and composer because he paid Dowland a salary that was very generous. Holman and O’Dette report, “His salary of 500 daler (more than £200 in contemporary English money)

\textsuperscript{15} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{16} Ibid.
made him one of the highest-paid court servants; his successor, Thomas Cutting, only received 300 daler.” Dowland brought no family with him to Denmark. In 1600, while Dowland was working in Denmark, he published *The Second Book of Songes*, with the help of his wife in London, who managed the sale of the original manuscript to the publisher.

As part of Dowland’s service to Christian IV he was allowed to travel to recruit musicians and purchase musical instruments. Dowland’s first trip took place in 1601 and then in a second trip to England in 1603 Dowland apparently tried again to obtain a court position. He was unsuccessful in his attempt but this visit did allow him to see *Lachrimae or Seaven Teares* through publication in 1604. Dowland’s service to Christian IV came to an end in 1604 when he last drew his salary. As Holman and O’Dette have said,

> It has been assumed that he returned immediately to England, but there is no record of his activities there for the next three years, and his statement in the preface to “*Andreas Ornithoparcus his Micrologus*” that he had ‘now returned home to remaine’ implies that he had arrived only recently.¹⁸

There is no record of Dowland’s activities between 1606 and 1609. It is possible that Dowland returned to his home in London on Fetter Lane immediately after leaving his position in Denmark or that he could have entered into service at another court during this time. Whatever the case may be, we know that by 1609 Dowland was living in his home in London because he states this in the signature of the *Andreas Ornithoparcus his Micrologus*.

By 1609 Dowland had become one of the most respected and renowned musicians in Europe. Despite this, his greatest ambition, to obtain a position at the royal court of England, continued to evade his grasp. When an opening among the royal lutenists appeared in 1610, Dowland was passed over again and the position was given to the lesser-

---

known lutenist, Simon Merser. Dowland continued to compose and in 1610 published his last work, *A Pilgrimes Solace*. On the title page of *A Pilgrimes Solace* Dowland states his authorship, “By John Douland, Batchelor of Musicke in both the Uniuersities: and Lutenist to the Right Honourable the Lord Walden.”\(^{19}\) Dowland did receive patronage during this time from Theophilus, Lord de Walden and in 1612 a court appointment did come to Dowland, as Holman and O’Dette state, “perhaps because Thomas Howard, Theophilus’s father, was acting Lord Chamberlain at the time,” and then, “By a warrant dated 28 October 1612 Dowland was given a specially created post, increasing the number of court lutenists from four to five.”\(^{20}\)

This appointment must have elated Dowland, so much to the extent that he stopped publishing altogether. It seems that Dowland either grew contented or tired in life because, in terms of biographical details, the end of his life is as sparsely filled as the beginning of his life. The last fifteen years of Dowland’s life cannot be characterized as having the same industrious fervor that the period between 1580 and 1612 can be. Perhaps Dowland took that time to enjoy his family in relative obscurity, no longer uncertain about the security of his musical legacy. There were compilations of his music published in continental Europe but this was probably done without Dowland’s knowledge or editorial hand. Dowland composed only a small number of pieces after 1612. Dowland continued to reliably fulfill his position at court until his death in 1626. He was buried on February 20, 1626 at St. Ann Blackfriars in London.

---


10
In conclusion, Dowland was a person who was very concerned about social standing and the state of his musical legacy. He was consumed in his commitment to his music from a young age. Dowland must have realized that his talent for music and performance was extremely unique and that his excellence in music was a way to travel upward through the Elizabethan social strata. While it may be excessive to say that the reason for his huge productive output before his appointment at court was to secure the appointment itself, but Dowland did see the position as an achievement that would secure a future for himself, his family, and probably his music past his own lifetime. Although Dowland did manage to maneuver his way to a court position, he appears not hold any political ambition above the station of court musician.
CHAPTER 3

HISTORICAL CONTEXT

The renaissance occurred later in England, roughly dating from the late 15th century to the early 17th century, than it did in continental Europe. The high point of the English renaissance occurred while Elizabeth I occupied the throne (1558-1603). England was in a state of relative peace during the Elizabethan era compared to the previous thousand years of its history. Although there was still some conflict between Catholic and Protestant forces, despite the crown's endorsement of the Anglican Church, the presence of conflict ebbed to a new low since the beginning of the reformation in the early 16th century. The social order and monarchy in England was still absolute during Elizabeth's reign. Parliament would need until 1649, during the English civil war when Charles I was tried and executed, to wrest power from the monarchy. England was in a period of expansion toward North America and the Caribbean and the English economy was stable if not prosperous during this time.

The Elizabethan period is referred to as a golden era for the arts primarily due to the work of William Shakespeare. However, music was also an important art in English society and was the queen's favorite art form. The revolutions in that took place in Elizabethan music were part of a general intellectual and social movement that was happening during this time in England. As Dorothy E. Mason says,

The same forces that produced writers like Sir Philip Sidney, Edmund Spenser, William Shakespeare, Ben Jonson, John Donne, and Francis Bacon also produced
musicians like William Byrd, Thomas Morley, Orlando Gibbons, Thomas Weelkes, and John Dowland.\textsuperscript{21}

Although many of these renaissance forces originated in Italy, England’s artists and musicians took these imported poetry and music forms, like the sonnet and madrigal, and created a style that was distinctly English. These new genres gave Dowland techniques to express the Elizabethan melancholic aesthetic and fashion.

The most important influence for musicians in England during the Elizabethan age came in the form of the Italian madrigal. Manuscripts of the Italian madrigal had been available early in the 16\textsuperscript{th} century in England but they were uncommon. Music publishing in England developed significantly with the aid of Queen Elizabeth in the 1580’s and with this development the madrigal gained greater exposure in England. According to Dennis Arnold and Emma Wakelin, “One of the most important publications was Nicholas Yonge’s anthology “\textit{Musica Transalpina}” (1588), which contains madrigals by such composers as Marenzio, Palestrina, and Ferrabosco (as well as two by Byrd) with their texts translated into English.”\textsuperscript{22} Dowland was undoubtedly aware of \textit{Musica Transalpina} because of its popularity throughout England and Dowland’s subsequent unsuccessful attempt to visit Marenzio in Rome. Dowland speaks very highly of Marenzio and mentions him in his “\textit{First Booke of Songes},”

Yet can I not dissemble the great content I found in the proferd amity of the most famous Luca Marenzio, whose sundry letters I received from Rome, and one of them,

because it is but short, I have thought good to set downe, not thinking it any disgrace to be proud of the judgement of so excellent a man.23

Marenzio’s musical style is characterized by its use of word painting, or the description of literal concepts such as the falling of a tear, through musical representation, e.g., a descending interval, and chromaticism. Dowland’s genius was to take these musical techniques and apply them to melancholic content.

The melancholic disposition was pervasive during the Elizabethan era. Robert Burton writes in the *Anatomy of Melancholy* (1621), “You may as soon separate weight from lead, heat from fire, moistness from water, brightness from the sun, as misery, discontent, care, calamity, danger, from a man.”24 According to Burton, melancholy seems to be a part of human nature as much as it is the product of an environment. This interpretation identifies the human condition as inherently tragic. Peter Holman says regarding melancholy,

Melancholy was the fashionable malady of the late Elizabethan age. (Robert) Burton and his contemporaries diagnosed many causes – social change, political uncertainty, challenges to religious and intellectual certainties, frustrated ambition, or just *fin-de-siècle* malaise – but they agreed that, in the words of John Donne, ‘God hath accompanied, and complicated almost all our bodily diseases of these times, with an extraordinary sadness, a predominant melancholy, a faintness of heart, a cheerlesnesse, a joylesnesse of spirit’25,26

23 Dowland, John. *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres of Foure Partes with Tableture for the Lute So Made, That All the Parts Together, or Either of Them Seuerally May Be Sung to the Lute, Orpharian or Viol De Gambo. Composed by Iohn Dowland, Lutenist and Bacheler of Musick in Both the Universities. Also an Inuention by the Said Author for Two to Play Upon One Lute*. Newly Corrected and Amended. Ed. Imprinted at London: By Humfrey Lownes, Dwelling on Bredstreet-hill, at the Sign of the Starre, 1613. Print.
Although it could be argued that England was at its cultural summit during the Elizabethan period, evidently, for the great creative minds of the era, there was still a great darkness to confront. Far from being off putting, having a melancholic attitude was attractive to many. The melancholic disposition became an indication that an individual was affected by and willing to confront the perceived darkness of the era.

There were a variety of types of melancholy during the late renaissance e.g., hermetic and poetic. Anthony Rooley suggests Dowland’s association with melancholy to be a product of hermetic neo-Platonism. Hermetic neo-Platonism is the belief that music and the planets are visual and auditory representations of an *a priori* dimension that exists before form. In this philosophy each planet and each mode and interval has its own influence on the temperament of each individual, e.g. an ascendant Saturn would dispose a person toward melancholy. Rooley notes,

> Another common device, which Dowland made particularly his own, is the madrigalian stock figure of the six-note chromatic theme. ...the six-note motif became a cliché for expressing distressed emotion and persisted until the end of the madrigal era. Dowland integrated the figure in his musical vocabulary in both ascending and descending forms and invested it with more than merely musical meaning. It is partly through the precise use of this device that we can pinpoint Dowland’s conscious application of numerology and abstruse philosophy to his music. In his hands such a formula takes on a symbolic power akin to a magical potion, and it is a corner-stone of our understanding of the functional nature of his music as a means for divine gnosiss.\(^{27}\)

Rooley also mentions that philosophical influences were critical,

> ...when he (Dowland) was in the service of Sir Henry Cobham, the queen’s ambassador to France. At this time the French academies had direct support from their king, Henri III, and there was at work the powerful and pervasive influence of neo-platonic philosophy cultivated in Italian academies of the previous 50 years. The thinking of such great figures as Marsilio Ficino, Pico della Mirandola and

---

Cornelius Agrippa was avidly studied and imitated by the French philosopher-poets and musicians.28

Ficino's thinking was particularly important and influential. Robin Headlam Wells states that, “Fundamental to Ficino's theory...,” is “…that through music man is capable of achieving a state of mystical union with the spiritus mundi which animates the universe.”29 However, although it is a possibility that Dowland might have been exposed to neo-platonic thought in France, what we can say that is definite is that Dowland did learn about Catholicism. Catholicism and hermeticism are certainly not mutually exclusive areas of learning and it is possible that Dowland spent some of his teenage years in Paris experimenting with different religions and philosophies. The problem is that Dowland, whether he is completely honest or not, later disavows his connection to the Catholic faith and describes his initial attraction to Catholicism as a product of youthful folly. Although Dowland does not openly mention any connection to hermetic thought, it is possible, if he did learn of it while in Paris, that his belief in hermeticism would undergo the same reevaluation that his belief in Catholicism did. Wells states that there is no way to know if Dowland was even interested in hermeticism, “Based as it is on conjecture, the external evidence for Dowland's alleged commitment to 'deep philosophical studies' must be considered to be inconclusive.”30 It may be true that Dowland was interested in esoteric thought but until there is conclusive evidence for this there is a danger of reading meaning into Dowland's work that he did not intend. However, the option still exists for a performer to superimpose neo-platonic esotericism on Dowland's work even if this wasn't Dowland's intention. Certainly, Dowland was concerned with musical affect. Whether Dowland’s

28 Ibid. 10.
30 Ibid. 518.
sense of musical affect was directly influenced by the ancient Greek notion of musical affect is unknown.

Another interpretation regarding Dowland’s sense of melancholy is that it was purely an artistic artifice. Dowland was known to be very interested in the relationship between language and music and his compositional style relies heavily on the technique of word painting. Consequently, Dowland was attracted to bold, extreme emotions that may be lent to easier depiction. Wells supports this premise, stating, “At a time when poets and composers were becoming increasingly interested in the problems of affective writing, grief, melancholy, and despair were welcomed because they provided an opportunity for the exploitation of new techniques.”

Under this view melancholic emotions, although dramatic and bold, are relatively unsophisticated and easy to musically represent compared to an emotion like nostalgia. For this reason Wells says, “If Elizabethan composers tended to choose lyrics which express simple, stylized emotions this is because they were interested in the transmission, not of ideas, but of feelings.” The implication of this theory regarding John Dowland’s sense of melancholy is that music is an inadequate art form to depict complicated events. For example, while music cannot give a successful account of the forces that led to World War I, it can move a person in sympathy toward an intended emotion.

If Dowland’s use of melancholic poetic content is purely for its ease of musical depiction and its effectiveness in having an impact that it had on listeners, then he is definitely in the business of creating an artistic persona. Although it is not known who the author of the lyrics is throughout Dowland’s work, for the purposes of understanding

31 Ibid. 523.
32 Ibid. 523.
Dowland’s music, this lack of attribution is not consequential. The fact is that Dowland consciously chose the lyrics that he did and that, as Wells states, the lyrics “lack any serious intellectual content,” and goes he on to say “I do not wish to imply that he lacked that great vision which inspires all great art. But a visionary is not necessarily a philosopher.”

Dowland’s use of melancholic content is purely circumstantial because of its simplicity, the fact that it was in fashion during the Elizabethan era, and its efficacy when used in a musical context. Wells agrees,

Dowland’s own remarks on music and poetry in general (in the dedication to the First Booke of Songes) and on melancholy in particular (in the dedication of Lachrimae) suggest that, while he shared the delight in the pleasures of melancholy which appealed to so many of his contemporaries, his own thoughts on the subject were of a mundane and entirely conventional nature.

In summary, what makes Dowland such an interesting figure is that he is able to synthesize many elements of style from his surrounding and consolidate these elements into a style that is highly original. The melancholic dimension of Dowland is part of his signature, as in the case of Semper Dowland, Semper Dolens, (Always Dowland, Always Doleful), it is part of what makes Dowland recognizable as Dowland. Much of his musical work has a sorrowful tint to it. However, to whatever extent Dowland experienced melancholy himself, he was not oppressed by these darker emotions and, based on the success he was able to achieve artistically and in his career, the specter of melancholy may have even invigorated his mind toward greater artistic heights.

33 Ibid. 526.
34 Ibid. 526.
35 Ibid. 526.
CHAPTER 4

POSSIBLE ALTERATIONS TO THE CLASSICAL GUITAR TO ACHIEVE A “LUTE-LIKE” SOUND

The lute and classical guitar differ remarkably in the quality of sound that they produce. The strings of a lute are at a higher tension and are also made of gut, which gives the high end of a lute a very resonant, piercing sound while the low end is muffled. The classical guitar is fairly well balanced from its low to high end, but is not a particularly resonant instrument. Some alterations that can be made to the classical guitar to achieve a similar sound to the lute include: using a capo, an alternate tuning, or different playing techniques, and making alterations to the transcription that one is using.

The most important dilemma for a classical guitarist who wants to play transcriptions of lute works is this: alterations to technique and equipment may give a lute-like sound, but the alterations do not necessarily use the guitar to its full potential. The choice is between authenticity and beauty. To an extent, every time a guitarist decides to play lute works on the guitar instead of the lute, a decision to move away from authenticity has already been made. To what degree a classical guitarist wishes to move away from authenticity and toward a classical guitar aesthetic is up to each performer.

Capo:

The purpose of using a capo is twofold: to give the strings of a classical guitar a higher tension and to bring the tuning of a classical guitar (E, A, D, G, B, and E) closer to the lute (G, C, F, A, D, and G). The simple solution seems to be that the performer would apply the capo to the third fret and be close to achieving the desired end. The problem in this
approach is that pitch during Dowland’s time is thought to have been lower than in the modern era. Herbert Myers says, “One well-known “fact” is that pitch in olden times was lower than our present international standard of a’=440.” During Dowland’s productive period there was not a standard pitch and each geographical region had different standards. If the goal of the contemporary performer is to play at the pitch of an Elizabethan period lutenist, then the capo should be applied to the second fret of the classical guitar. However, if the goal is to create a tension that is most similar to the lute, then the capo should be applied at the third fret or even higher. Placing the capo on the second fret makes performing renaissance music on the guitar slightly easier because the twelfth fret is usually the highest note of the composition. Playing above the twelfth fret is more difficult and requires more practice and dexterity.

Tuning:

There are many different types of lutes that include those with different numbers of strings. For my purposes I will look at the most popular type of lute in Elizabethan England and the type that Dowland most likely played, the eight-course lute. All of the strings were doubled either in unison or an octave lower. The first string (G) was the only string that was sometimes not doubled. The reason that the first string would sometimes be singular was to create a clear, singular sound for the soprano voice. If the doubled string was not perfectly tuned to unison, the upper voice would sound blunt and unclear. Opinions differed during Dowland’s day as to whether or not bass strings should be tuned in octaves or unisons. Dowland did not prefer octave bass string tuning it because it produced

---

parallel octaves in the bass parts, but the majority of renaissance lutenists played with bass strings tuned to octaves. The low register of the lute is too faint and muffled to be played effectively with single strings. Doubling the strings and tuning them to octaves or unisons gives the bottom end more power and primacy. The tuning of the eight-course lute is as follows:

Example 1: Lute Tuning

The biggest difference between the lute and classical guitar is in which strings are tuned a major third interval away. In the classical guitar, this is between the 2\text{nd} and 3\text{rd} strings (G-B) and in the lute it is between the 3\text{rd} and 4\text{th} strings (F-A). The easy solution to adopt on the guitar is to down tune the 3\text{rd} string from G to F# so that the major third interval is now between the 3\text{rd} and 4\text{th} strings (D-F#). This detuning affects the resonance of the guitar. In normal guitar tuning (E, A, D, G, B, E) the major triad present is G major

and the minor triad is e minor. When we retune the guitar to (E, A, D, F#, B, E), the major triad present is D major and the minor triad is b minor.

**Lute Techniques:**

Left hand techniques on the lute are remarkably similar to left hand techniques on the classical guitar. The larger difference comes from the right hand or plucking hand. Lutenists were known for the “thumb under” and “thumb out” techniques where the thumb was used to alternate with the index finger (p-i) for melodic lines. Classical guitarists perform this technique with the index and middle fingers alternating (i-m). The thumb-index alteration creates a definite strong-weak relationship in the alteration. Generally, it is appropriate to start with the thumb on the downbeat so that the emphasis created with the thumb is on the downbeats, and the index finger creates the weaker sound on the off beats. However, this could be reversed if there was a strong dissonance on the weak beat that resolved on the downbeat.

A good example of the dilemma between authentic lute performance technique and guitar technique is the performance of the groppo. In Example 2 there is a typical fingering using lute technique.

![Lute Fingering](image)

**Example 2: Groppo Fingering On A Lute**
It was common for lutenists to pluck every note of an ornament all on one string. This technique produces a strong response on a lute because of the resonance of the treble strings but can often sound thin on the classical guitar. In Example 3 there is a typical solution to the groppo that brings out the resonance of the guitar.

Example 3: Groppo Fingering On A Classical Guitar

Example 3 shows cross string technique where guitarists will play each note of the groppo alternating between the first and second string. This cross string technique is a cleaner, crisper, and more resonant solution to performing the groppo on the classical guitar than executing the ornament on one string.

The question for each classical guitarist is, when to adopt lute techniques and when not to choose them. There is no set of rules. Each technique brings out a certain effect and a certain technique does not have to be uniformly adhered to. If the ideal is to create the most beautiful and resonant sound on the classical guitar, then certain techniques will work in specific contexts while others will not. What is important is that these decisions be made consciously with full knowledge of all alternatives.
**Guitar technique:**

Since much of Dowland’s music is written in a vocal style, it is important to play his music as legato as possible, connecting all of the notes. Staccato should only be used to periodically interrupt the legato texture. Dowland’s lute works are based on the voice. Notes in succession, for the most part, should be unbroken like the exhalation of breath. It also follows that when any cadence is reached, time should be taken, like an inhalation, before the next exposition.

In order to achieve these effects on the guitar, the left hand must not leave the strings when a note is played until exactly when the next note is played. To achieve the clarity that Dowland’s counterpoint requires, it is also necessary to position the right hand perpendicular to the strings. In making this alteration the bass notes will achieve greater primacy, however, which is unlike the lute. The lute has great resonance in the trebles but not in the bass. One solution is to play the bass notes with the flesh of the thumb but this technique separates the soprano and bass drastically.

Since the bass strings of the Elizabethan lute were doubled in octave, sometimes it can make sense to add an octave even when one isn’t written. It is important to keep in mind, however, that the bass strings on the lute were doubled to add emphasis to the weak lower range of the instrument, a problem that the guitar does not have. There are musical contexts where this can make sense, e.g., long single melodic lines with bass pedal points.

Sometimes it can be useful to play unisons instead of single notes to create greater resonance in the guitar. This technique is only possible for longer notes because it is extremely difficult to execute rapid scale passages with unisons and would be impractical. If the unison is performed in the context of other notes that are not in unison, care must be
exercised concerning the dynamic level at which the unison is played. Unisons are louder than single notes if they are performed with the same force due to the physical phenomena of constructive interference. If unisons are performed in a context of single notes, the unison must be performed with slightly less force to avoid interrupting the musical texture.

Another issue is that, since the treble strings of a classical guitar are not as resonant as those of a lute, long tied notes have trouble sustaining for their entire value and suspensions and resolving voices can be relatively ineffective. The way to solve this issue is to treat the ties as nonexistent and pluck the note again.

Now I will discuss the decision-making process concerning making alterations to the classical guitar and technique in the context of the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15*. We will discuss the topics of tuning, use of capo, and issues of lute and guitar technique and apply them to the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15*. This section is intended to be an example of the process a classical guitarist can experience when deciding on what alterations to the guitar and playing technique to adopt when creating an interpretation of a work by John Dowland.

Using a capo will create tension in the strings and make the guitar sound more like a lute. If that is what the performer hopes to achieve, the first issue to deal with is the score and where to place the capo. Since the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* is in a minor mode (e minor) and that requires the open strings of the guitar in order to be heard, if a capo is used, the sounding pitches will be transposed however many tones higher the capo is applied. If guitarists want to perform the pitches as notated, then they cannot use a capo in the *Lachrimae*. However, if the guitarist is not willing to compromise on the timbre that the capo gives the guitar, then the sounding pitches will be higher. In the case of the latter, the guitarist treats the capo as the nut of the guitar and, if, for example a capo was applied on
the second fret, treats the second fret as open position. This is much easier for guitarists to read than to apply the capo and attempt to read with a whole new set of open strings.

The second issue is whether to tune the 3rd string to an F# to create a lute tuning. If one's goal is to retain a guitar like sound, since the harmony of the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* is in e minor (E, G, B), keeping the 3rd string an open G makes sense but considering that at major cadences the piece moves to a major mode (E, G#, B), the resonance of the open 3rd string is nullified. Detuning the 3rd string to an F# has benefits in both minor and major modes, however, because the F# is part of the dominant (B, D#, F#) in both cases. Detuning the 3rd string to F# also makes it possible to perform mordents in the minor mode on the 3rd string (Example 4). If one’s goal is to create a lute like sound with the guitar then the capo should be used.

Example 4: Mordent In *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15*

This ornament is commonly performed by lutenists in the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* on the opening chord of measure 1 and also measure 9.

The lute technique of alternating the thumb (p) and index (i) fingers when performing scale passages should be used as much as possible because it emphasizes the strong-weak relationship between the down and up beat.
Example 5: Lachrimae Pavan P. 15
Example 5: Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 (Continued)
Example 5: *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* (Continued)

Part of the difficulty in performing scales with $p$, $i$ is, when the scale descends and the string has to change, e.g., from the first string to the second, if the last note on the first string is played with $p$ and the first note on the second string is played with $i$, shifting from a lower right hand position to use $p$ to a higher position to perform $i$ can be difficult and feel unnatural. The difficulty of a technique does not disqualify it, however, especially when it produces a desired effect. Still, there are times in the *Lachrimae Pavan* when alternating the index and middle ($m$) fingers is easier to execute and more resonant on the guitar. In Example 7 are a series of scale passages that have an ornamental function of an already stated theme (Example 6).

Example 6: $i, m$ Fingering (Unornamented)

Example 7: $i, m$ Fingering (Ornamented)
Playing Example 7 with $i, m$ results in a more guitaristic, fluid, mellifluous sound. $I, m$ works especially well for ornaments or developments of thematic material whereas $p, i$ works well for the thematic material itself. For example, the tear motif or main theme of the Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 benefits from $p, i$ technique because it accentuates and establishes the relation between consonance, dissonance and meter (Example 8). In this case the thumb would play the dissonances and passing tones on the off beats and the index finger would play the resolutions on the strong beats. In the first and second measure of the theme, it is reasonable to use $i, m$ when the thumb is being used to play a bass note.

Example 8: $p, i$ Fingering In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15

In the case of the groppo in measure 26 used in Example 9, it is standard lute technique to play this ornament on the first string but played on the guitar, the groppo is more resonant when using a cross string technique (Example 10).

Example 9: Groppo Lute Fingering In Lachrimae Pavan P. 15
Example 10: Groppo Guitar Fingering In *Lachrimae Pavan* P. 15

In conclusion, a guitarist’s commitment to a guitar or lute-like sound, as well as the alterations and techniques that help to achieve either sound, should not become dogmatic. I recommend that each guitarist try both approaches and then make a decision based on which experience is preferable. However, there is no answer that is right for every occasion. It may be that for a particular concert a guitar sound is preferable even if a lute-like sound is normally preferred. There is an infinite amount of variables that can influence the decision-making process of a guitarist, not the least of which being the performer’s artistic temperament.

If musicians are interested in the evolution and development of their interpretive powers, then they must refine and reexamine the process that they engage in when creating an interpretation. The collection of ideas presented here is specifically targeted toward classical guitar players that are interested in the work of John Dowland, but the framework for processing artistic dilemmas and engaging in the interpretive endeavor can be used by all musicians.
CHAPTER 5

AGOGIC ACCENTS

In this chapter I will define agogic accents, discuss their use, and give examples, using Nigel North’s performance of the Farewell Fantasy P. 3 from his recording, Lute Music Vol.1: Fancyes, Dreams, and Spirits. Of the three lutenists discussed in this treatise, Lindberg, O’Dette, and North, North uses the most agogic accents and tempo rubato.

Agogic accents are expressive devices that are concerned with duration and not dynamics. The term “agogic” is used to describe a wide variety of expressive devices, e.g., pausing, rallentando, accelerando, and rubato. Mention of agogic accents can be traced back to at least the 16th century. Matthias Thiemel notes that,

A pause of breath of phrasing (suspiratio) is mentioned in a number of organum sources, and in the 16th century the pause (suspirium) was recognized as having affective value. Calvisius recommended delaying or accelerating the beat in connection with the harmony and the sung text (1602). Modifications of the basic tempo seem to have become increasingly common during this period; they are clearly described in Frescobaldi’s preface to his first book of toccatas, and are also mentioned by Monteverdi.

Agogic accents and tempo rubato were designated toward melodic instruments in an ensemble setting in the 18th century. Thiemel further notes,

Throughout the 18th century agogic took a syncopated form: the accompaniment kept time while the melodic part employed hesitations which sometimes modified the rhythm considerably. C.P.E. Bach wrote that ‘the finest lapses from metre can often be industriously [that is intentionally] produced’ when ‘one makes an

alteration in one’s own part alone, running against the organization of the metre, while the main movement of the metre must be observed precisely’ (1753, pt i, chap. 3, §8).

An interesting question worthy of further study, but beyond the scope of this treatise, is how agogic accents should be handled in the context of Dowland’s compositions for consort or ensemble. The focus of this treatise is how agogic accents and tempo rubato should be handled in the context of Dowland’s solo lute works, specifically the *Farewell Fantasy* P. 3.

Solo lutenists and classical guitarists do not have the benefit of other musicians maintaining a beat or meter over which the soloist can expand and contract time. It is still possible for a performer to internalize the tempo, and when the tempo is contracted, it is then later expanded at the same proportion to bring the performer back to the correct place in time. The other option is that the performer disregards any commitment to the idea of “correct time” and expands and contracts time at will. This is the method that Nigel North adopts. This gives time in music more of a pulse than a constant beat and allows for each phrase to be shaped temporally as well as dynamically.

Michael Kennedy remarks about the use of agogic accents,

The first note of a phrase, for instance, may be felt to suggest a slight lingering which conveys the effect of an accent: similarly, a leap to note significantly higher or lower than the preceding notes, or a strong discord resolving to a concord, may convey an effect of accentuation (by means of lingering, pressure etc.) and there are other examples.\(^{41}\)

In North’s performance, there are examples of all of the preceding methods of applying agogic accents.

\(^{40}\) Ibid.


33
Now I will talk about how agogic accents can be applied in the context of the “Farewell Fantasy P. 3. Kennedy states that an agogic accent can be applied to the “first note of a phrase.” North applies this idea immediately to the first note of the piece (Example 11).

Example 11: Agogic Accent In "Farewell Fantasy P. 3 Applied To First Note Of A Phrase

Instead of giving the first note a strict half-note time value, North sits on the note for approximately 25 percent longer than is notated. This works well because the quarter note pulse of the piece is not defined until the fourth beat or the second iteration of a quarter note. The first note takes on a meditative, indeterminate length when an agogic accent is applied that does not interfere with the basic quarter note pulse in the “Farewell Fantasy P. 3. At the third to last note North uses a common rallantando that stretches the duration of the last few notes, giving a cadence to the high B octave.

There are other similar occasions where there is a chord instead of a single note that begins a phrase where the same effect can be applied. North uses this in the middle of measure 21 when he begins a phrase (Example 13). North pauses on the e minor chord for approximately 50 percent longer than is notated. This effect can be very useful to the listener because it signifies a beginning or ending and gives the piece audible structure.

42 Ibid.
Example 12: Farewell Fantasy P. 3
Example 12: Farewell Fantasy P. 3 (Continued)
There are other similar occasions where there is a chord instead of a single note that begins a phrase where the same effect can be applied. North uses this in the middle of measure 21 when he begins a phrase (Example 13).
Example 13: Agogic Accent Applied To A Chord At The Beginning Of A Phrase

Applying agogic accents to notes that are approached by a large intervallic leap are especially effective. The discretion of the performer will decide whether to apply the accent to the note that is leapt from, leapt to, or both. In North’s case, he chooses to apply an accent to both notes, letting the interval be surrounded and, therefore, outlined by agogic accents. In Example 14, in the fourth measure North gives each note that surrounds the intervallic leap of a fourth, on the first and third beats, an agogic accent.

Example 14: Applying Agogic Accents To Leaps (1)

This use of agogic accenting gives the interval a quality of weight or gravitational pull. It makes the interval seem to the listener, not difficult to perform, but that it requires a moment to prepare for such as when one lifts a large stone. Example 15 also shows North’s use of this agogic accent in measures nine and ten.
Example 15: Applying Agogic Accents To Leaps (2)

North uses the same technique for the leap of a third in the second half of the ninth measure and for the leap of a fourth on the first beat.

Dowland's music is filled with dissonance resolving to a consonance, and there are many examples of an agogic accent being applied to the dissonance. In Example 18 at the beginning of measure 27 North pauses on the first beat for close to 50% longer than is notated.

Example 16: Applying Agogic Accents To Dissonances

In renaissance music it is common for the mode to suddenly change. This is another place where using an agogic accent can be effective. North performs this type of accent on the fourth beat of measure 33 (example 17). The harmony suddenly changes from B major to G major, and North gives each chord around 25 percent more time than is notated.
Example 17: Applying Agogic Accents To Modal Shifts

To summarize, the affective power of agogic accents is the control that it gives the performer to shape music temporally. Agogic accents provide freedom from the dogma of the metronomic aesthetic but are not always appropriate either. It is necessary for a performer to understand how agogic accents are used because, if not, the use of agogic accent can become disorganized and create a confusing effect for the listener. It is also common for music to most benefit from a strong sense of beat with no use of agogic accent at all. In Dowland’s case, however, the affective power of the agogic accent is primary to the nature of his music, the lute, and the guitar. The soul of both the lute and the guitar are intimately bound to a flexible, rubato feel because they are both, almost always, solo instruments. In the context of a solo performance, a musician has more liberty with musical pulse because there is no other musician that the soloist needs to keep pace with. It is still the case that some solo repertoire benefits most from a lack of agogic accents, but it will always be the tendency of lutenists and guitarists to employ this expressive device to a greater extent than an orchestral instrument or the piano.
CHAPTER 6

ORNAMENTATION

A variety of ornaments were used in music composed in the renaissance. In this chapter I will discuss and define each ornament, analyze three performances of Dowland’s *Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41* by Paul O’Dette, Nigel North, and Jakob Lindberg to give context for how and when ornaments are used, and, finally, describe how each ornament is performed on the classical guitar. Since Dowland originally wrote in tablature, I have transcribed the tablature for modern notation with the aid of Diana Poulton’s and Basil Lam's, *The Collected Lute Music of John Dowland*.43

The ornaments that I will discuss are the groppo, gruppetto, slide, mordent, inverted mordent, appoggiatura, and acciacatura. In some instances Dowland aids the performer by writing out his ornaments, especially in the case of the groppo, but in others, like the mordent, he is not explicit in how this ornament is applied, leaving it to the performer to determine. In John Dowland’s music there is still great opportunity to improvise ornaments and divisions, but it should be noted that Dowland is more explicit about these embellishments than many composers of the same time period and, instead of relying on the ability of the performer, Dowland chose to make clear what he thought was appropriate.

---

Groppo:

The groppo and gruppetto are both ornaments that in modern times are referred to as “turns.” The groppo was an ornament used at a cadence that, as Bruce Dickey says, was a “special type of division involving the alternation of two notes followed by a termination”\(^{44}\) and “a four-note turn approaching the tonic from the leading tone, though occasionally it was applied to a cadence from the upper semitone”.\(^{45}\) Dickey notes that Nicola Conforto “distinguishes these ornaments as the *groppo di sopra* and the *groppo di sotto*.”

Example 18: Two Types Of Groppo

Dowland frequently writes out the groppo. In the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* Dowland uses the groppo at both major cadential areas, e.g., the end of the A, B, or C section, and in minor cadential areas, e.g., when he changes or defines the mode within a section. In Example 19 Dowland uses the groppo to conclude the second A section of the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15*. In Example 20 he uses the groppo in the beginning of the second B section to define the mode.

---


\(^{45}\) Ibid.
Example 19: Cadential Groppo Di Sopra 46

Example 20: Modal Groppo Di Sopra 47

Gruppetto:

The Oxford Dictionary of Music defines the gruppetto as being, “a 4-note figure, the
note above, the note itself, the note below, and the note itself. This figure is perf. after the

46 Dowland, John. Lachrimæ, or Seauen Teares Figured in Seauen Passionate Pauans Vvith
Diuers Other Pauans, Galiards, and Almands, Set Forth for the Lute, Viols, or Violons, in Fiue
Parts: By Iohn Dowland Bacheler of Musicke, and Lutenist to the Most Royall and Magnificent,
Christian the Fourth, King of Denmarke, Norway, Vandales, and Gothes, Duke of Sleswicke,
Holsten, Stormaria, and Ditmarsh: Earle of Oldenburge and Delmenhorst. London: Printed by
Iohn Windet, Dwelling at the Signe of the Crosse Keyes at Povvles Wharfe, and Are to Be
Solde at the Authors House in Fetter-lane Neare Fleet-streete, 1604. Print.
47 Ibid.
note itself or *instead of it*, according to whether the turn sign is placed *after* the note itself or *over* it.”

Example 21: Two Types Of Grupetto

Using the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* as a template demonstrating how Dowland used the grupetto, one notices that in the first C section of the pavan, the line is unadorned (Example 27), but in the second C section the grupetto is used (Example 23).

Example 22: Without Grupetto

Example 23: With Grupetto

---


49 Ibid.
Slide:

Grove Music Online defines a slide as, “two short notes rising by step to the main note.” It is common for the slide to occur between an interval of a third. A slide can be performed in ascension and descension as well as on the beat or in anticipation of the downbeat (Example 24).

Example 24: Slide

In the context of John Dowland’s music, one can look to the beginning of the B section of Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 to notice a common place where a slide could be performed (Example 25 and 26).

Example 25: Without Slide

Example 26: With Slides

Mordent and Inverted Mordent:

Grove defines a mordent as “A type of ornament which, in its standard form, consists in the rapid alternation of the main note with a subsidiary note a step below.” An inverted mordent places the subsidiary note above the main note.

Example 27: Mordent And Inverted Mordent

Dowland infrequently writes out either mordents or inverted mordents. This gives each performer a great deal of freedom in deciding where to use these ornaments. Example 28 and Example 29 provide a context in the Lachrimae Pavan P. 15 where a mordent could be applied. Example 30 and Example 31 gives a context where an inverted mordent could be applied in Queen Elizabeth's Galliard P. 41.

Example 28: Without Mordent

Appoggiatura:

Grove Music Online defines an appoggiatura as, “A ‘leaning-note’. When used as a melodic ornament, it usually implies a note one step above or below the ‘main’ note and creates a dissonance with the prevailing harmony, and resolves by step on the following weak beat.” Examples 32 and 33 show an appoggiatura. The defining feature of an appoggiatura is that the dissonance occurs on the downbeat and resolves to a consonance.

on the weak beat. The written grace note normally is given half of the rhythmic value of the resolving note. Example 32 illustrates this concept.

Example 32: Appoggiatura With Notated Grace Note

Example 33: Appoggiatura Without Notated Grace Note

Acciaccatura:

Robert E. Seletsky writes, “In the 19th century, acciaccatura came to mean quick single grace notes, usually a major or minor 2nd above the main note; these were defined as short appoggiaturas in the 18th century by Quantz (1752) and C.P.E. Bach.”

Acciaccaturas can occur as a quick pick up note to the downbeat, directly on the beat, or somewhere in between (Example 34).

---

Example 34: Two Types Of Acciaccatura

Over dotting and dotting:

It was common for early music performers to transform rhythms with techniques called overdotting and dotting. In the case of a rhythm that is dotted already it can be, over dotted or double dotted (Example 35).

Example 35: Over dotting

In the case of straight rhythms, e.g. eighth notes, these can be transformed to dotted rhythms energizing the rhythmic texture (Example 36).

Example 36: Dotting

Measure 28 in the *Lachrimae Pavan P. 15* (Example 4) is a place where a performer could use dotting effectively (Example 38).
Now I will examine performances of Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 (QEG) by three modern lute virtuosi, Paul O’Dette, Nigel North, and Jakob Lindberg. This analysis will give insight into the context in Dowland’s work in which ornaments can be applied and also the variety of options that exist for every performer when making decisions concerning ornamentation. The following transcriptions are not meant to be note for note accurate renderings of their corresponding recordings. Each recording uses the same version of Queen Elizabeth’s Galliard P. 41 but, as is the case in the renaissance style, the performers will add or subtract notes from chords and use accidentals that are unwritten. Rather, the transcriptions are only meant to show how different performers use ornaments in different ways.

Paul O’Dette:

For this analysis I have chosen Paul O’Dette’s recording, My Favorite Dowland.\(^{54}\) In this version, O’Dette performs QEG the fastest of the three performers at approximately

quarter note=104. O’Dette also uses the narrowest variety of ornaments, choosing to use only inverted mordents and one mordent. His use of the mordent is at the first true cadence when the subject concludes on the second beat in measure four. This usage, and also Example 5 in the Lachrimae Pavan P. 15, gives the mordent a feeling of finality. O’Dette uses the inverted mordent copiously, seemingly applying them wherever and whenever he wants.

Nigel North:

For this analysis I chose North’s recording, Lute Music Vol. 4: The Queen’s Galliard. North performs QEG at the medium tempo of quarter note=88. He also uses the smallest quantity of ornaments of the three performers, but he uses a slightly wider variety than O’Dette, including inverted mordents, a trill, and a slide. North is the least metronomic of the three performers and, although he uses few ornaments, concentrates the power of his interpretation in the expansion and contraction of time. North’s choice to use very few ornaments highlights the already adorned qualities of Dowland’s work. Nigel North seems to think that less is more and, especially in this case, lets Dowland’s composition speak for itself.

Jakob Lindberg:

For this analysis I chose Lindberg’s John Dowland: The Collected Works Of the three performers, Lindberg includes the most variety in his ornamentation, including mordents, inverted mordents, acciaccaturas, a trill, and a slide. Lindberg’s performance is slightly faster than North’s at approximately quarter note=92. His recording also reflects a dryer

---

sound aesthetic, occupying a space with little reverb. Lindberg’s sound highlights the ornamentation and power of Dowland’s composition if taking away from the affective beauty of the sound of his recording.

In conclusion, in each of the three performances we see a different take on the use of ornamentation. It should be noted that the amount of ornamentation that a performer uses is related to how fast the chosen tempo is. Paul O’Dette uses a large number but small variety of ornaments. He uses only mordents and inverted mordents because he plays at a higher tempo and using a wider variety of ornaments at a fast pace would either be difficult to perform or would create a frantic effect. In both North and Lindberg’s performance a medium tempo is chosen which gives the performer more time to perform ornaments. North uses the fewest number of ornaments because so much of his interpretive expression is devoted to agogic accents.

Each of these performers has a large repertoire of interpretive techniques. It is important to notice that none of the performers feel compelled to use every ornament or as many ornaments as possible. Ornaments are one aspect of interpretation and if they are too prevalent, it is possible for the other aspects, e.g., agogic accents and embellishments, to suffer. How many ornaments are used should depend on how the performer wishes to balance ornamentation with the other elements of interpretation.
The Most Sacred Queen Elizabeth, Her Galliard P. 41
(Performed by Paul O'Dette)
The Most Sacred Queen Elizabeth, Her Galliard P. 41
(performed by Jakob Lindberg)

\( \text{\textcopyright 2015} \)

Example 41: *Queen Elizabeth's Galliard P. 41 (Performed By Jakob Lindberg)*

55
CHAPTER 7

RENAISSANCE EMBELLISHMENT

In this chapter I will define renaissance embellishment, discuss its historical context, give examples, and discuss how it can be applied to Dowland's Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2.

Bruce Dickey says, “Of all the performance practice issues which must be taken into account in performing music of earlier times, perhaps the one with the most potential to radically affect the sound of the music is improvised ornamentation.” Whether one labels it embellishment, improvised ornamentation, diminution, or creating divisions, playing in the style of a 16th century musician has obvious obstacles. It is difficult enough for a modern jazz musician to master the style of bebop legend Charlie Parker in 2015 only 70 years after Parker was active but much less easy for a musician to master the style of renaissance composers and musicians working 430 years ago. Perhaps the greatest impediment for a student of early music, unlike in the case of Jazz, is that early music was originally performed before recording technology was invented. There is no audio recording of music played during the renaissance. What exist are treatises and first-hand accounts of performances written during the renaissance period. Bruce Dickey cites these, saying,

Information about the art of division is contained in division manuals, theoretical works of broader focus, and letters. The manuals from the sixteenth century are those of Sylvestro Ganassi (1535), Diego Ortiz (1553), Girolamo Dalla Casa (1584), Giovanni Bassano (1585), Riccardo Rognoni (1592), Giovanni Luca Conforto (1593), Giovanni Battista Bovicelli (1594), and Aurelio Virgilio (ca. 1600).

58 Ibid. 302.
While these are helpful, in themselves without any audio record, these sources are not a complete account of performance practice during the period.

As Robert Donington rightly points out, “Music hardly ever, if at all, consists only of its basic progressions. It is embellished.” Embellishment is extremely common in its written out, through composed form. However, composers did not always completely write out the details of each musical embellishment. Donington says, “We are so accustomed in the modern West to the composer providing his own figuration in its entirety that we may not realize how different the situation has been at other periods.” During the renaissance period it was common for composers to let performers supply their own improvised embellishments.

Embellishment, or diminution, is a method of taking long note values and dividing them into many notes of shorter duration. In jazz improvisation, performers use harmonic progressions as a basis for improvisation, but in the renaissance, performers used melodic and intervallic contour as the basis for improvisation. Greer Garden defines diminution as, “A term used in the context of improvised embellishment during the renaissance and Baroque periods to describe a melodic figure that replaces a long note with notes of shorter value.” Improvisation in the renaissance primarily consisted of finding elaborate ways of dividing up long notes into many short notes and configuring them in a way that their succession makes musical sense in relation to the next note that is to be divided.


57
Embellishment is not universally supported and when taken to its extreme can obscure music. For example, in an ensemble context, if every musician is improvising vocal embellishments, then the text will be muddled and hard to understand. Howard Mayer Brown agrees,

Embellishments intended for an ensemble of singers or instrumentalists should be fewer and simpler than those improvised by a single lutenist or keyboard player, or by a solo singer, or recorder or viol player.\(^{61}\)

Queen Elizabeth wrote of the liturgical value of keeping embellishment at a minimum in the 49\(^{th}\) injunction of 1559,

> A modest distinct songe [for the body of the service] that the same may be playnely understood, as yf it were read without syngying [but for the anthem] the best sort of melodie and music that may be conveniently devised, having respect that the sentence of the hymne may be understood and perceived.\(^{62}\)

Dowland himself was wary of the tendency of embellishment to muddle otherwise clear, well-written music. O’Dette and Holman mention how Dowland, in the preface to *The Pilgrim’s Solace*, “went on to attack large sections of his profession, including ‘simple Cantors, or vocal singers’ who excel in ‘blinde Division-making’ but are ignorant of theory.”\(^{63}\) Dowland represents the trend that eventually moved away from embellishment because his writing is so explicitly worked out. Dowland, for example, writes out the repeats, ornamentation, and embellishments instead of leaving them to the improvisational devices of the performer. Still, improvisation was a required skill for performers during

---


the renaissance and was an important metric that distinguished great performers from mediocre musicians. Since Dowland was by all accounts extremely skilled as a lutenist, during a period where there was a premium on improvisational ability, it would follow that he was also a capable improviser.

Since there is such an abundance of sources on embellishment and each treatise carries its own style of improvisation, it is important to isolate the principles that each treatise has in common. These commonalities are the fundamentals that each early music performer must understand if one wants a command of improvised embellishments. According to Dickey, “By the middle of the sixteenth century, the method of teaching division had become standardized.”

Dickey notes also that, Improvisation can be daunting to the beginner, who may easily feel overwhelmed by the available choices. Fortunately, Virgiliano has left us a set of rules that go a long way toward reducing these choices, eliminating those which would lead to difficulties. According to Dickey, the first six of Virgiliano’s ten rules are the most pertinent to the fundamentals of improvised ornamentation. These six rules are:

1. The diminution should move by step as much as possible.
2. The notes of the division will be alternately “good” and “bad” notes.
3. All the division notes that leap must be “good” (i.e., consonant).
4. The original note must be sounded at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end of the measure, and if it is not convenient to return to the original note in the middle, then at least a consonance and never a dissonance (except for the upper fourth) must be sounded.

---

5. When the subject goes up, the last note of the division must also go up; the contrary is also true.

6. It makes a nice effect to run to the octave either above or below, when it is convenient.66

In Example 42 I have created a simple division that illustrates how these rules work.

![Example 42: Embellishing An Interval Using Virgiliano’s Rules](image)

Example 42: Embellishing An Interval Using Virgiliano’s Rules

The first rule is truer for vocalists than instrumentalists because stepwise motion is more natural and easier to execute for the voice. Considering Dowland’s main musical influence, the madrigal that is primarily a vocal genre, using stepwise motion for any embellishments in Dowland’s music would fit this style. The second rule refers to “good” and “bad” notes which are terms for consonances and dissonances. Rule 3 requires a consonant interval whenever the line leaps. In Example 42 the line leaps by a major third. Rule 4 states that the first note must appear at the beginning, middle, and end of the division. Rule 5 requires that the last note of the division approach the second original note from the same direction as the original note before being divided.

---

Applying embellishments to *Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2* presents problems because Dowland’s composition is chromatic, dense, and very well embellished in the b section. The dilemma is determining where would an appropriate place be to embellish the texture of Dowland’s work without muddling the composition. I chose to apply embellishments to measures 17-26 (Example 44) because it is a resting point in the piece where the texture becomes more homophonic. Example 44 is a written example of how embellishments can be applied to *Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2*.

Finally, embellishments are the most expendable element of interpreting the solo lute works of John Dowland. This is because Dowland explicitly writes out embellishments and therefore his musical texture is rarely characterized for its sparsity than it is for its density. However, even simple embellishments have the power to transform Dowland’s music into a highly personal and original interpretation. Embellishments are also exciting to listen to for people who know Dowland’s works well.

Ideally, a performer of early music would have a repertoire of different embellishments memorized and be ready to utilize these when necessary. When a performer reaches the highest level of proficiency, the performer should be able to spontaneously create embellishments to the extent that the performer could play the same piece a hundred times and embellish it in a different way each time.
Example 43: Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2
Example 43: *Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2* (Continued)
Example 44: Forlorn Hope Fancy P. 2 embellishments
CHAPTER 8

CONCLUSION

One of the most important points to take away from this treatise is that artistic goals and interpretive objectives are not necessarily black and white. The guitar sound versus lute sound decision illustrates a continuum between two points with many possible combinations rather than one choice between two possible outcomes. For example, a guitarist might choose to perform the *Farewell Fantasy P. 3* using a capo, detuning the 3rd string to F#, using normal guitar technique (i, m), not to use agogic accents, use as many ornaments as possible, and not to use embellishments. These choices are perfectly legitimate. What is most important is that these choices be made by the conscious mind and not in a state of ignorance. Even if a musician doesn’t know that a decision exists, in the process of learning and eventually performing a piece of music, many decisions will have been made.

Although there are many interpretive choices for each guitarist to make, there is also an important technical standard to meet. Ornaments, agogic accents, and embellishment do not add to a performance if the notes are not accurately performed with a consistent, clear tone. Dowland frequently uses voice leading, and it is absolutely necessary that each voice remain connected from entrance to exit. In general the use of legato is preferred but, depending on the musical texture, this can occasionally change.

This treatise presents a wide collection of interpretive issues for a classical guitarist to consider when interpreting John Dowland’s solo lute works but it should not be
considered complete. I encourage further research into interpreting Dowland on the classical guitar. Hopefully, this treatise will inspire future guitarists to learn more about Dowland and, above all, continue to play and master his ingenious darkness on six strings.


Dowland, John. *The First Booke of Songs or Ayres of Fourre Partes with Tableture for the Lute So Made, That All the Parts Together, or Either of Them Seuerally May Be Sung to the Lute, Orpherian or Viol De Gambo. Composed by John Dowland, Lutenist and Bachelor of Musick in Both the Universities. Also an Inuention by the Said Author for Two to Play Vpon One Lute.* Newly Corrected and Amended. Ed. Imprinted at London: By Humfrey Lownes, Dwelling on Bredstreet-hill, at the Sign of the Starre, 1613. Print.


BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Jesse Acker-Johnson is an active performer, composer, and teacher in the California, Massachusetts, New Mexico, and Florida music scene. Jesse Acker-Johnson first began to play and study music as a young teenager. He played in rock and jazz ensembles as an electric guitarist before concentrating on classical music. While studying to earn his Bachelor of Arts in Philosophy, he began studies in classical guitar with Michael Chapdelaine at the University of New Mexico. He then continued his studies with Marc Teicholz while studying to earn his Bachelor of Arts in composition from California State University East Bay. Jesse graduated with a Masters of Music in classical guitar performance where he studied with Eliot Fisk at The New England Conservatory. Together with Mr. Fisk, Jesse is currently compiling collections of renaissance lute music transcribed for guitar.

Jesse has performed in America and Italy. He has played in churches, community centers, nursing homes, museums, private homes, and recital and concert halls. His compositions range from solo guitar and piano to use of electronic media and site-specific recordings.

Jesse is a committed educator. He actively engages in outreach within his community and gives lessons and classes.

Jesse is currently pursuing his Doctor of Musical Arts degree in classical guitar at Florida State University studying with Bruce Holzman.